A National System of Local Music Education Services

Report of a Feasibility Study

Prepared by Music Network | 2003







An Roinn Ealaíon, Spóirt agus Turasóireachta | Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism

Disclaimer

While Music Network has taken every care in collating information for this report, it does not assume and hereby disclaims any liability to any party for loss or damage caused by errors or omissions the report may contain.

Acknowledgements

Music Network wishes to express gratitude to the many people who contributed so generously to the preparation of this report. Special thanks are extended to: members of the Advisory Group; Jack O'Brien, whose own report of 2001 has been a key resource in informing sections of this report; the IVEA, who undertook to survey member VECs throughout Ireland regarding their existing music schemes; Frank Heneghan and Chris Kinder, who kindly supplied extended written contributions; the respondents to the questionnaire survey and to all who devoted time to attend meetings as part of the consultation process.

First published 2003 by Music Network Coach House, Dublin Castle, Dublin 2, Ireland © Music Network 2003

0-9528783-5-6 ISBN

Glossary

The term Local Music Education Services has been employed throughout the report to convey the twin elements within the model (i.e. an instrumental and vocal music education service outside of normal school hours and a music-curriculum support service within the classroom). It is intended that the model is not prescriptive regarding the means of service delivery, e.g. whether the model be building-based, peripatetic, outreach-based, or some combination or synthesis of these.

A number of specialist terms are employed throughout the report including

- Music education: used in the broadest sense, as an umbrella term to cover the entire range of activity in this field.
- Instrumental and vocal music education: a more specific term describing a holistic approach to learning to play a musical instrument or to sing within an educational environment where individual or group tuition is accommodated alongside ensemble activity and other related disciplines. The latter include options in aural training, theory and musicianship, improvisation and composition.
- Education Centres: formerly known as Teachers' Centres, these facilities have been established as regional support centres for classroom teachers by the Department of Education and Science. A total of twenty-one full-time and nine part-time Education Centres currently operate around the country.

Abbreviations

CDB	City or County Development Board
EMU	European Music Schools Union
IAMS	Irish Association of Music Schools
IAPA	Irish Academy of Performing Arts
IVEA	Irish Vocational Education Association
IRMA	Irish Recorded Music Association
LMES	Local Music Education Service
LMESP	Local Music Education Service Partnership
MEND	Music Education National Debate
NCCA	National Council for Curriculum and Assessment
NCTE	National Council for Technology in Education
NMEC	National Music Education Council
PCSP	Primary Curriculum Support Programme
VEC	Vocational Education Committee

Con	tents Page
Fore	word from Chairman of Music Networkv
Pref	ace from Chairman of Feasibility Study Advisory Groupvii
Exe	cutive Summary
1	Introduction
1.1	Background to feasibility study6
1.2	Framework of issues
1.3	Methodology employed6
1.4	Existing provision
1.5	Objectives of the proposed model
1.6	Defining the model9
2	Structural Issues
2.1	Horizontal dimension
2.2	Vertical dimension
3	Educational Issues
3.1	Role of Local Music Education Services
3.2	Educational role of the National Music Education Council
4	Resource Issues
4.1	Income
4.2	Expenditure
5	Implementation Plan
5.1	Establishment of the Implementation Group
5.2	Role of the Implementation Group
5.3	Establishment of National Music Education Council

Foreword

One of the few aspects of life which simultaneously opens our hearts, our imaginations and our capacity to understand the world around us is music. Each of us is born with some capacity for this marvellous activity. Once developed, it does not leave us.

The power of music is tremendous. It can unlock the development of the socially insecure child, open the world of art to the uninitiated and create a link between our cultural heritage and the society in which we live. It does not require physical strength, favourable location, money, or power to understand. It should be at the very heart of the education of the human being.

The potential of both the high musical achiever and the average person should be developed. It is the ambition of Music Network to bring this about in Ireland.

The report which follows is a blueprint for making musical education available throughout the country and to people of all ages and ranges of talent. If it is implemented, talented composers and performers will appear; new audiences will materialise to hear them; and our young people will be educated to enjoy a range of experience that will remain with them for life.

Miriam Hederman O'Brien Chairman Music Network

Preface

This report is presented with both optimism and enthusiasm to two government ministers and departments. At the heart of the report lies a project where those two departments can find common cause: the establishment over time of a national system of Local Music Education Services that would enrich the lives of communities up and down the country. Commissioned at a time of economic sunshine, the report is presented under cloudier skies. That should not be a cause for concern, for the report does not seek a 'quick-fix' solution. Rather it argues for a phased introduction, over more than a decade, of a service that could transform the musical, cultural and community life of towns and townlands throughout the country.

It is widely accepted, and borne out by a wide range of excellent reports and studies that precede and underpin this present document, that music in Ireland rests on uneven foundations. That unevenness is most manifest in the provision of music education as part of general education and also in vocal and instrumental tuition. There is welcome evidence that the former is being addressed in a comprehensive and developmental fashion. The present report, if acted upon, would provide further assistance through the curriculum support service as a key element of the proposed national system of Local Music Education Services. In the case of vocal and instrumental tuition, despite some excellent provision in various institutions and schemes, we lack the kind of systematic provision appropriate to a twenty-first-century European country so distinguished by its cultural achievement and identity. Whole regions of Ireland lack appropriate provision and hundreds of thousands of citizens are thereby culturally deprived. This report rests firmly on the principle of equality of access for all citizens, complementing the right of an individual to realise his or her full human potential, including the potential for development musically.

In structural terms the report offers the kind of 'joined-up' thinking which is appropriate to lifelong learning and to public service efficiency. Thus, at different ends of the continuum, we welcome both the increased attention being paid to the musical education of Irish schoolchildren and the process of establishing an Irish Academy of Performing Arts. We believe that those endeavours will make their full contribution to civil society when the centre of the continuum is strengthened and enriched by the provision of a national system of Local Music Education Services as outlined in this report.

Martin Drury Chairman Advisory Group

Executive Summary

This report has been produced as a result of a commitment made in May 2001 by the Minister for Arts, Heritage, Gaeltacht and the Islands to fund a feasibility study which would examine how a national system of publicly-supported local "schools of music" might be provided in Ireland.

It recognises the existing gaps within music education provision in Ireland, particularly with regard to children's access to instrumental and vocal music education. It recommends a pragmatic model of cost-effective service provision to address those gaps. The model involves the creation of a national system of Local Music Education Services, publicly supported, socially inclusive, community focused, of high quality, to complement the teaching and learning of music in the classroom. The main features of the model have been analysed and presented on the basis of structural, educational and resource issues which are closely integrated.

Structural

- Nationally: A National Music Education Council (NMEC) will be established initially as a non-statutory body affiliated to the Department of Education and Science. Its main functions will be to provide quality assurance and ensure educational consistency. Membership will be broadly based and will include the Department of Education and Science, the Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism, the Arts Council, representatives of educational institutions and representatives of the broader music sector. It will subsequently become a statutory body.
- Locally: Local Music Education Services Partnerships (LMESPs) will be created as working groups of individual City and County Development Boards in order to design and deliver Local Music Education Services. LMESP membership will include local statutory agencies, together with education, arts and community interests. The key service-delivery roles

will be performed by VECs and Education Centres. The national network of LMESs, in conjunction with existing classroom-based music education, will constitute a first tier of national music education provision. This tier will complement existing and planned provision at all levels, from beginner through to professional entry.

Educational

- LMESPs will offer twin-stranded music education services:
 - (i) instrumental and vocal music education services (outside school hours)

(ii) complementary music-curriculum support services (in the classroom).

- Music services will be designed to ensure access and social inclusion, and to counter educational disadvantage. Music syllabi will be broadly based and capable of accommodating a range of music genres.
- VECs will employ a team of specialist teachers to deliver the instrumental and vocal music education service and the curriculum support service and will facilitate delivery by providing all necessary administrative structures and necessary facilities to the team.
- Education Centres will co-ordinate the music-curriculum support service offered to local primary and secondlevel schools.

Resources

- The Department of Education and Science will fund the operation of LMESs, primarily in terms of staffing costs, disbursing resources through NMEC.
- LMESs will be cost-effective, utilising existing capital infrastructure and administrative resources.
- The establishment of an all-Ireland body focused on music education will present the possibility of accessing international funds.

In addition, the report makes specific recommendations regarding the implementation of the model.

- The Department of Education and Science will establish an Implementation Group to undertake work on
- (i) operational costings (based on the recommendations of the O'Brien Report, 2001)¹
- (ii) setting educational criteria
- (iii) setting a timeframe for phased introduction of LMESs, and the establishment of NMEC.
- Because the national system of LMESs will be established in accordance with a phased programme, the resourcing costs will be incurred gradually. Upon establishment, NMEC will issue a call for submissions from LMESs to participate in Phase 1 of the programme, and negotiate agreements with up to six selected LMESs within one year of the initial call for submissions.
- NMEC will oversee a gradual rollout of the complete programme, with a time-tabled target of creating a LMES in every city and county in order to ensure genuine access. Subsequent phases of the programme will be introduced roughly every five years, with the aim of completing a national system within fifteen years of the initial call for submissions

Review of Music Provision in the City of Dublin, City of Limerick and County Cork Vocational Education Committee Schemes.

This report was commissioned by the Department of Education and Science in 2001, and is an unpublished departmental document. The report was made available to Music Network by the author, Jack O'Brien, for the purposes of this feasibility study. It is envisaged that any Implementation Group set up to realise the recommendations of this feasibility study would be granted access to the O'Brien report, which provides a basis for costing the model proposed in this document.

Chapter 1 Introduction

Abstract

This report recognises the gap that currently exists in the public provision of music education, particularly with respect to instrumental and vocal music education. As a result, many children are unable to develop their potential in music making. The report makes pragmatic suggestions to government as to how this issue should be addressed. The report argues that, in order to ensure that children are given equitable access to opportunities to learn to play a musical instrument, it is necessary to design and implement a model of publicly-supported provision. Such a model should complement existing classroom provision of music education by offering both an extra-curricular, community-based instrumental and vocal music education service and a music-curriculum support service to local schools. The proposed model is a cost-effective, publicly-supported national system of Local Music Education Services focused primarily at first and second-level education, i.e. children of school-going age.



Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 Background to feasibility study

In May 2001 the Minister for Arts, Heritage, Gaeltacht and the Islands, Silé de Valera TD, agreed to fund a feasibility study, to be carried out by Music Network,² to examine how a system of publicly-supported local 'schools of music' might be provided. It was envisaged that such a system would enable children to avail of the opportunity to learn a musical instrument within their locality at an affordable price, and that the quality of local provision would be assured within the context of a national system. Such a service should be complementary to state provision for music education within the school system.

The decision to fund this feasibility study complements the decision of government in 2000 to invest in increased provision for advanced level arts education, in the form of an Irish Academy for Performing Arts. Indeed, in announcing its decision to establish the Academy, the government acknowledged the importance of arts education provision at lower levels:

'I would like to stress that I recognise that it is not enough to have a policy for advanced training in the performing arts if you do not also encourage and support more basic provision in all parts of the education system.'³

During the course of the research and consultation processes which informed this document, it became apparent that use of the term 'music schools' could misrepresent the nature of the recommended model. It was observed that use of this term might infer a recommended mode of service delivery which was solely building-based. It was agreed that the broader term 'music education services' was more useful in communicating the model's intended means of delivery, which could combine aspects of a building-based model with peripatetic and outreach-based aspects involving the use of satellite centres. This new term was therefore adopted and is used consistently throughout the report.

The terms of reference of the feasibility study were: to recommend to government a model for the systemic provision of an instrumental and vocal music education service which is

- Iocally accessible
- high quality
- publicly subsidised
- appropriate to the cultural context in Ireland
- complementary to existing music provision within the formal education system.

1.2 Framework of issues

The report recommends a model of publicly-supported service provision which takes account of three interdependent sets of key issues:

- Structural issues: addressed in Chapter 2
- Educational issues: addressed in Chapter 3
- Resource issues: addressed in Chapter 4

1.3 Methodology employed

The report is based upon a substantive body of work begun in June 2001 consisting of three elements:

- Research
- Consultation
- Formation and input of an Advisory Group

2 Music Network was created in 1986 by The Arts Council/An Comhairle Ealaíon to develop music in Ireland, with a specific regional remit. Music Network is funded by The Arts Council/An Comhairle Ealaíon. 'Music Network is designed to give everyone in Ireland access to musical activity of the highest quality' (Policy 2000, p. 3). Music Network takes the view that provision of music education, particularly for children of a school-going age, is a fundamental aspect of access to music.

5

(i) The Research process included

- conducting an audit of existing instrumental and vocal tuition provision. This was undertaken in order to build an accurate and up-to-date picture of current provision.⁴
- considering a broad range of recent reports and other relevant national and international literature.⁵

The report recognises the work carried out by others in providing an in-depth analysis of music education in Ireland, dating from *Deaf Ears?* in 1985 to the report of the *Music Education National Debate (MEND)*,⁶ completed in 2002. The *MEND Report*, for example, emphasised the central importance of providing opportunities for active music-making within any education system, and highlighted the nature and extent of various problems currently faced in tackling this issue in the Irish context. Music Network acknowledges the value of these earlier reports in the process of preparing this feasibility study report, and seeks to build upon their impact.⁷

(ii) The Consultation process involved twin elements

- Seeking the views of a broad range of interested parties, both private individuals and representatives of organisations.⁸ This involved initiating national and local press campaigns to raise awareness of the study, and the circulation of a series of structured questionnaires. In addition, meetings were held with a significant number of interested parties, both individually and in plenary groups.⁹
- Examining practice in other jurisdictions in the area of public service provision of instrumental and vocal music education. This involved desk-based research, fieldtrips, and direct meetings with representatives of organisations in countries with a history of good practice.

(iii) Formation and input of an advisory group

An expert Advisory Group was established for the purpose of advising and assisting Music Network in the production of the feasibility study. The first meeting of this group took place in December 2001 and it met regularly until December 2002 on a total of eight occasions. Membership of the group included officials of relevant government departments, the Arts Council, and practitioners experienced in the field of instrumental music education.¹⁰

1.4 Existing provision

(i) Instrumental and vocal music education

The Department of Education and Science is responsible for the provision of access to music education within the classroom through the music components of the primary and second-level school curricula. 'Performing', together with 'listening and responding' and 'composing', is an integral element of the primary curriculum.¹¹ The primary curriculum envisages that children will learn simple music performance skills within the classroom, by singing and playing basic musical instruments. However, the primary curriculum also aims 'to enable the child to develop his/her musical potential....'.12 It is natural for parents wishing to realise their children's musical potential to seek opportunities for their children to expand and develop their instrumental or vocal skills, thereby allowing them to become increasingly involved in the process of musicmaking. Without provision of access to a comprehensive, equitable, and publicly-supported instrumental and vocal music education service, this potential will not be fully realised for a significant number of children.

Similar problems are manifest in second-level schools, where the music curriculum at both junior and senior cycles includes an essential component of instrumental or vocal performance. At Leaving Certificate, for example, candidates have the option to choose a performance module accounting for 50% of available marks.¹³ Yet publicly-funded opportunities to develop the performance skills required for the Leaving Certificate performance module are limited to what the classroom music teacher can provide within the confines of the music timetable. Whereas some students are in a position to supplement their instrumental or vocal studies by availing of tuition services outside of school, the fact that large numbers of children in many parts of the country cannot do so creates inequity. Existing publicly-supported provision is far from

- 8 For a list of those who contributed to the consultation process, see Appendix 4
- 9 The views communicated by respondents have been summarised and, since May 2002, have been made available on the Music Network website at www.musicnetwork.ie/feasibilityupdate.html
- 10 For membership of Advisory Group, see Appendix 1
- 11 Primary School Curriculum: Music, pp 6-7

⁴ See www.learnmusic.info, a database of instrumental and vocal music education in Ireland

⁵ See bibliography

⁶ An article relating to MEND, written by Frank Heneghan, is provided as Appendix 3

⁷ For full list of reports consulted see Bibliography

¹² Ibid, p. 12

¹³ Leaving Certificate Music Syllabus, pp 3-4

comprehensive and takes the form of a small number of state-supported institutions¹⁴ and VEC-supported schemes.¹⁵ However this provision is sporadic rather than systemic and, inevitably, results in inequality of access.

Furthermore many adults wishing to enjoy the benefits of adult and further education opportunities in music are unable to avail of the requisite services.

In addition to publicly-supported services, private service providers and community-based groups offer opportunities to learn to play an instrument or to sing, for those in a position to avail of them.¹⁶ However experience has shown that access is only fully available to those whose circumstances permit, owing to factors such as geographical proximity to services, educational background and socio-economic advantage.

(ii) Music curriculum support

In recent years the number and range of music projects, whether delivered in school contexts or in community settings (such as performance venues), which, broadly speaking, are designed to give new life to children's music education experience have increased significantly. Many of these projects have been delivered by Arts Council funded organisations,¹⁷ reflecting the Council's own long-standing involvement in this area. They have operated alongside projects run by institutions such as the National Concert Hall, RTÉ Music Division, and others. Other agencies have funded such initiatives via the private sector¹⁸ or via different public sources.¹⁹ Many of these initiatives have been pilot projects, exploring new methodologies in specific contexts, usually with the aspiration that they might be replicated or mainstreamed, given core investment by a funding agency. A few projects have been successful in achieving continuing support from the Department of Education and Science,²⁰ or other funding bodies. More typically, however, because of the lack of a governing policy in this area, projects of this nature have been short-lived. Currently no facility exists to collate the learning from these various music education projects in a coherent way, or to evaluate their impact on children's music education. Such a facility, promoting best practice, could form the basis of a strategy of

enrichment for the teaching and learning of music in the classroom.

(iii) Developing existing provision

Although much good practice exists, with regard to both instrumental and vocal music education and classroom-focused curriculum-support activity, it is not delivered in a consistent and strategic fashion by the current system. As a result both the quality and, perhaps even more significantly, the accessibility of such services are inconsistent. The model recommended in this report has been designed to address these shortcomings.

1.4.1 Ireland in a European context

In many European countries there is evidence of commitment at state level to provide a full and balanced music education. Typically this involves a comprehensive approach, integrating provision of access to opportunities to learn to play a musical instrument or sing with provision for the teaching and learning of music in the classroom. This is particularly striking in the case of Norway, where parliament recently passed legislation to ensure local provision of publicly-supported Kulturskole throughout the country (1999). As a result there are now 412 such schools with significant municipal funding throughout Norway, all of which offer instrumental and vocal music education services alongside educational opportunities in other artforms, including drama and visual arts.²¹ In many cases these actions by national governments are built upon previous commitments made in a European context.22

Many kinds of music school systems flourish in Europe, making the task of drawing comparisons between countries difficult. A certain amount of valuable work has been undertaken in this regard by the European Music Schools Union (EMU).²³ For the purposes of its statistically-based analysis, EMU defines 'music schools' as 'institutions for music education, ensemble playing and singing for children and adults', operated on a non-profit basis.

¹⁴ Cork School of Music (a constituent school of CIT), Dublin Institute of Technology Conservatory of Music and Drama, Royal Irish Academy of Music, Dublin and Waterford Institute of Technology School of Music

¹⁵ See Appendix 5 for more information on VEC music schemes

¹⁶ See www.learnmusic.info, a database of instrumental and vocal music education in Ireland

¹⁷ For example, Cumann Náisiúnta na gCór, Irish Chamber Orchestra, Opera Theatre Company, Music Network, West Cork Music, and others

¹⁸ For example, ESB has sponsored the National Concert Hall's In Tune education and community outreach programme

¹⁹ For example, the Vogler Quartet in Sligo music education initiative, core funded by The Arts Council and Sligo Local Authorities, attracted additional funding from the In-Career Development Unit of the Department of Education and Science, the ESB, and the IRMA Trust

²⁰ For example, the National Chamber Choir's Composition Workshops initiative, 2002 – 2004; the Vogler Quartet in Sligo music education initiative

²¹ See www.musicschools-emu.net or www.kulturskoleradet.no

²² Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, Recommendation 929, adopted 8 October 1981, see Appendix 2

In the EMU study (1999), Ireland scores consistently poorly in all of the key indicators, as can be seen in the table below.

	Slovenia	Belgium*		Denmark		Ireland
No. of music schools	53	93	140	234	282	12
POPULATION (MILLIONS)	2.0	4.5	5.1	5.3	8.9	3.6
% PUPILS**	3.4	1.5	3.0	9.0	12.2	0.2

* Brussels and Wallonia regions only

** (aged 0-25) participating in instrumental or vocal music education

The table shows that there would seem to be a general correlation between the scale of provision and the perceived quality of a country's music education system. Countries such as Finland,²⁴ Denmark and Sweden (which score considerably higher than other countries in terms of the number of music schools and the percentage of pupils participating in instrumental or vocal music education) possess systems of music education which are widely regarded as being of a very high quality.

Despite the inevitable shortcomings of statistical comparisons, these figures support the widely-held view that Ireland is significantly out of step with its European counterparts in providing access to a comprehensive system of music education which includes instrumental and vocal music education.

1.5 Objectives of the proposed model

- To guarantee access by enabling children to avail of instrumental or vocal music education within their own locality.
- To provide a national system which will guarantee the quality of local provision.
- To complement and support state provision for music education within the school system.

1.6 Defining the model

In order to create a national system of Local Music Education Services, the model highlights the significance of successfully combining two perspectives:

- (i) national perspective: ensuring equal opportunity, quality and educational consistency.
- (ii) local perspective: ensuring local ownership and community integration.

Chapter 2 Structural Issues

10

Abstract

The structure of the recommended model can be characterised in terms of its horizontal and vertical dimensions (as illustrated in Diagrams B and C respectively), allowing national and local elements to complement each other naturally.

In terms of the horizontal dimension, a new national body, the National Music Education Council (NMEC) should be created in order to

- provide national educational consistency
- provide quality assurance
- control the flow of central funding.

NMEC should be established under the auspices of the Department of Education and Science, and should include representation from that department and from the Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism, other arts and education bodies, and music education practitioners.²⁵

New local bodies, Local Music Education Service Partnerships (LMESPs), should be created as local agencies charged with managing the delivery of the new music education services. NMEC would have a regulatory role over the LMESPs. The LMESPs should evolve on a county-by-county basis and should be established as working groups under the auspices of City and County Development Boards. In line with the aims of the Task Force Report on Integration of Local Government and Local Development Systems (Department of the Environment and Local Government, 1998) LMESPs membership should include local statutory agencies and broader community representation. As members of the LMESPs, county or city Vocational Education Committees (VECs) and the local Education Centres should, additionally, have key roles in delivering specific elements of the Local Music Education Services. The VECs should deliver public instrumental and vocal music education services outside of school hours. The local Education Centres should deliver a complementary music-curriculum support service to local schools during the school day (see Diagram B, p. 13).

In addition, consideration should be given to the establishment of cross-border links between NMEC and an equivalent music education body in Northern Ireland.

In terms of the vertical dimension, the model should provide a natural 'first tier' in a national system of publicly-supported instrumental and vocal tuition services (see Diagram C, p. 19). The principal target group for Local Music Education Services should be children in primary and second-level education, although this should be set in the context of a policy of lifelong learning. The new services should complement existing provision of instrumental and vocal education at higher levels (e.g. second-level and third-level courses at Cork School of Music (a constituent school within CIT), DIT Conservatory of Music and Drama, Royal Irish Academy of Music and others), together with existing third-level courses at universities and other institutions. Additionally the Local Music Education Services would complement the development of the proposed Irish Academy of the Performing Arts (IAPA).²⁶

25 See also 2.1.1

²⁶ IAPA is an initiative which, until January 2003, was being developed by the Department of Education and Science. An Interim Governing Authority was established in 2002, to begin the task of setting up the institution, based upon recommendations in the Renshaw Report (1999). At the time of going to print, the Department of Education and Science was in discussion with the Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism, with reference to transferring IAPA to their ageis.

Diagram B - Structural Model: Horizontal Linkages



Indicates flow of the public service

Chapter 2 Structural Issues

2.1 Horizontal dimension

2.1.1 National element

National Music Education Council (NMEC): Linkage at national level

The National Music Education Council (NMEC) should be established by government, under the auspices of the Department of Education and Science. Membership of NMEC should include representatives of the Department of Education and Science and the Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism, as well as other arts and education bodies, and music education practitioners. Such a structure represents a real opportunity for two government departments with a shared area of interest to work together, and could be used as a basis for cross-departmental co-operation involving other art forms.

NMEC should consult and communicate regularly with other statutory educational bodies such as the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) and have the potential to link with bodies such as the planned Teaching Council and Examination Commission. In addition NMEC should engage directly with the Arts Council in order to align interests, share experience and research, and explore methods of co-operation.

Remit of NMEC

NMEC should have two primary functions:

- 1. to establish and apply criteria which will ensure educational standards including
- proper access
- educational consistency
- quality assurance
- 2. to manage the disbursement of central government funding to Local Music Education Service Partnerships.²⁷

NMEC will exercise educational stewardship and control by requiring Local Music Education Service Partnerships (LMESPs) to submit proposals outlining the services they intend to develop. Proposals should include specific reference to the following.

i. Ensuring access

- The provision of an out-of-school, community-based instrumental and vocal music education service
- The provision of an in-school music-curriculum support service at primary and second levels.

The provision of a music-curriculum support service would ensure that all children attending primary school, and those attending second-level schools which avail of the service on offer, could benefit from this element of their Local Music Education Service. The provision of a second element, i.e. an instrumental and vocal music education service, offers many children the option of additional or progressive engagement with music education for the purpose of further exploring their musical potential.

Specifically, LMESP proposals should address the following access-related issues:

- Economic access: fees should be structured so as to enable children from low income families to participate, and subsidised instrument banks and music libraries should be provided.
- Geographical access: penetration of service should be widespread throughout city or county (e.g. whether by use of central buildings, outreach and/or peripatetic models of delivery).
- Access according to scale of service: target participation rates should be set, in real and in proportional terms, for numbers and proportion of children availing of service. These should be benchmarked to good practice in other jurisdictions.²⁸
- Selection criteria: the basis should be defined upon which
 - (a) individuals are selected for instrumental and vocal tuition services
 - (b) schools are offered/selected for curriculum-support services.

ii. Ensuring educational consistency

NMEC will require that the scope, content, and means of delivery of individual LMESPs' music education services comply with specified criteria designed to ensure a level of national consistency.²⁹ To this end LMESP proposals should be required to address issues such as

(a) Nature of instrumental and vocal music education service, including

- mission statement outlining educational ethos of the Local Music Education Service
- range of music genres to be offered
- range of instruments to be offered
- method of teaching and learning (e.g. by individual tuition and/or group tuition)
- range of instrumental and vocal music education subjects offered, including course content and provision for public performance opportunities
- commitment to ensemble activity and group music making

(b) Nature of curriculum-support service, including

- outline of service content (e.g. in-service training, workshops, performances and special projects)
- Iinkage to other in-service supports for teachers such as the Primary Curriculum Support Programme (PCSP)
- Iinkage to other local music and arts service providers, e.g. Local Authority Arts Office, local venues, local voluntary music and arts sector.

iii. Quality assurance

NMEC will have a key role in ensuring that individual LMESPs adhere to national quality guidelines. This is particularly relevant with regard to issues such as quality of teaching practice and student progression.³⁰ To this end LMESPs should, in their proposals to NMEC, indicate how they intend to establish performance indicators and self-evaluative mechanisms for the Local Music Education Service.

In order to guarantee the implementation of the agreed quality assurance mechanisms it is recommended that NMEC provide for the establishment and operation of an appropriate inspectorate.

iv. Additional criteria

NMEC will require that LMESPs demonstrate their ability to deliver an effective music education service which is locally relevant and responsive to the communities it seeks to engage, and which maximises existing local resources. LMESP proposals should therefore also address specifics such as

- method by which partnership has been/is to be established
- defining designated area of operation of LMESP
- listing local agencies and groups involved in LMESP
- relevant experience of constituent local agencies and groups in the field of music education
- resources available to LMESP (funding, infrastructure, personnel).

2.1.2 Local element

Local Music Education Services should be developed through the creation of Local Music Education Service Partnerships, established as working groups under the auspices of the City or County Development Board (CDB) and linked back to the relevant Director of Community and Enterprise. This idea reflects government policy as outlined in the role envisaged for CDBs:

The direct involvement of the social partners, of the community/voluntary sector, and of the local development agencies in the work of the Board.....will help to facilitate a process which would see local communities play a constructive role in shaping their economic, social, and cultural future.³¹

31 Task Force Report (Department of the Environment and Local Government, 1998), 8.9, p. 14

The Local Music Education Service Partnerships should be broadly based, typically involving relevant bodies such as

- statutory agencies, including Local Authorities, VECs and regional Health Boards
- Iocal Education Centres
- representatives of the primary and second-level school sectors
- broad community representation, including the local music and arts sector.

In terms of delivery of services it is recommended that

- VECs deliver the instrumental and vocal music education element of the Local Music Education Service as a direct public service
- Education Centres take responsibility for co-ordinating the music-curriculum support service to the two main school sectors: primary and second-level.

In terms of administration of services it is recommended that VECs utilise their existing administrative structures and resources and liaise with the respective Education Centres to ensure effective local delivery of the instrumental and vocal music education and curriculum support services.

The role of the VEC: delivery of instrumental and vocal music education service

VECs are well positioned to develop and deliver the instrumental and vocal tuition element of the Local Music Education Services because they possess key resources such as

- capital infrastructure: with its own network of strategically-located school buildings each VEC could ensure provision of access throughout its area.
 Where necessary the Local Music Education Service Partnership could also negotiate the use of other school buildings after school hours.
- administrative capacity: each VEC has an administrative structure capable of delivering the proposed instrumental and vocal music education element of the Local Music Education Service. This includes the capacity to act as employer of the music service's specialist teaching staff.

ethos: with its tradition in vocational education, previous and existing experience in providing instrumental teaching schemes, and long-standing commitment to adult education and lifelong learning, the VEC system offers a sympathetic educational ethos and environment.

VECs in many parts of the country have over the years striven to provide music services.³² In particular, VEC-organised instrumental music tuition schemes offering subsidised tuition have survived and today flourish in three VECs: County Cork, City of Limerick, and City of Dublin. These schemes have been successful, and it seems likely that any emerging LMESP wishing to establish itself in one of these geographical areas will seek to build on this strength and incorporate the existing VEC music scheme into its proposal for a new LMES structure.

The role of the Education Centres: delivery of curriculum support

Education Centres, established as local support centres for classroom teachers by the Department of Education and Science, should play a significant role in co-ordinating the delivery of the curriculum-support element of each Local Music Education Service. In this way curriculum-support specialist teaching staff appointed to the Local Music Education Service would work with teachers in local schools throughout their area. These specialist teachers would constitute a small subset of the overall teaching complement of the Local Music Education Service and, as with their counterparts in the instrumental and vocal music education service, would be employed by the local VEC.

- This arrangement would have the following advantages:
 Education Centres are ideally positioned to liase with local schools and co-ordinate the delivery of services.
- Education Centres have specialist experience in co-ordinating local delivery of the Department of Education and Science's national curriculum-support programmes. Significantly, local delivery of the Primary Curriculum Support Programme (PCSP) music component is currently in preparation and due for delivery in 2003-2004.

- Following the delivery of the PCSP music component (i.e. from September 2004 onwards), it is likely that a number of *cuiditheoirí* will be appointed as specialist advisors in the primary music curriculum. Education Centres, as co-ordinators of the Local Music Education Service's curriculum-support service, could link directly with *cuiditheoirí*, thereby creating synergies and integrating the content of local curriculum-support initiatives into wider national priorities.
- The services of the curriculum-support teachers will be offered to primary and second-level schools in the LMES region, in support of existing music teaching within the classroom.

2.1.3 Horizontal linkage: local to national

Upon establishment the National Music Education Council (NMEC) will invite tenders from prospective Local Music Education Service Partnerships (LMESPs) using relevant criteria and guidelines. As a regulatory body NMEC will require that LMESPs outline their plans to create a new Local Music Education Service according to the model outlined in this report. Applications will be assessed according to key criteria, as outlined in 2.1.1 above.

LMESP applications which meet the prescribed criteria will be considered by the NMEC. A decision to authorise the establishment of a LMESP would be accompanied by a funding agreement between the NMEC and the LMESP.

This mechanism is akin to that currently employed by the Sports Council in developing its *Local Sports Partnership* initiative.³³ A similarity also exists with the system operated in Finland, where central control over funding for local music schools is an inherent part of the model.³⁴ Similarly, in the area of adult learning, the government White Paper *Learning for Life* (2000) recommends the creation of a national and local framework for service delivery which includes a National Adult Learning Council and a corresponding system of locally based structures, the Local Adult Learning Boards.³⁵

2.2 Vertical dimension

Implementation of the model recommended in this report will create a 'first tier' in public provision of instrumental and vocal music education, linked to delivery of the national curricula for music at primary and second level. This comprehensive provision will identify many children who wish to pursue instrumental and vocal music education at third level and, in some cases, beyond. This report shows that an opportunity now exists to create and implement a publicly-supported, integrated and progressive system of instrumental and vocal music education operating at every level (see Diagram C, p. 19).

2.2.1 Existing and planned provision

In recent decades there has been a proliferation of third-level music courses established by various institutions and offering a range of education and vocational training options. The courses offered include undergraduate and postgraduate programmes. The focus of individual courses varies, with some offering vocational instrumental and vocal training at third level, while others treat music education within a broader academic context. Music can also be taken as an elective component within the BEd structure for primary teachers, and as an integral part of pre-service training for the post-primary teaching profession.³⁶

Government is currently in negotiation regarding the future of an Irish Academy of Performing Arts (IAPA). It seems likely that as part of its remit this institution would include provision of third and possibly fourth-level (professional-entry level) training for instrumentalists and singers.

33 For further information on the Sports Council structures, and set-up processes for LSPs, see Appendix 6
34 For further information see Finnish Music Schools Association website, www.musiikkioppilaitokset.org
35 AONTAS, February 2002, p. 3
36 A list of institutions offering third-level and post-graduate music and music education courses is given in Appendix 7

2.2.2 Integration

There are a number of practical ways in which the proposed new system of LMESPs could integrate with existing musical education.

- LMESPs could arrange for the provision of specialist tuition for advanced or especially gifted students within existing regional and national music education institutions.
- LMESPs could consult with, or form mentoring relationships with, existing regional and national music education institutions³⁷ (e.g. on practical issues such as how to manage the start-up phase, setting syllabi, timetabling, etc.).
- Where appropriate, LMESPs may choose to integrate the work of existing private service providers into the proposed public instrumental and vocal music education service, subject to agreement and fulfilment of quality-assurance requirements of NMEC.
- LMESPs could become members of support organisations such as the recently established Irish Association of Music Schools (IAMS), thereby benefiting from a direct link to experienced and influential bodies such as the European Music Schools Union (EMU).

In addition there are a number of ways in which NMEC may be linked into existing and planned provision at third level and beyond.

- NMEC may examine the possibility of forming links with the range of institutions now offering third-level courses in music or music education.
- NMEC may seek to liase with the Interim Governing Authority of IAPA to ensure that the potential value of consistent and progressive provision of instrumental and vocal music education is realised.
- NMEC should explore the potential for establishing links with existing or planned national education bodies such as the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA), the Primary Curriculum Support Programme (PCSP), the Teaching Council, and the Examination Commission.

2.2.3 Vertical integration: a regenerative model

As referred to above, this model offers the potential to create a continuum in public provision for instrumental and vocal music education. The educational benefits of Local Music Education Services will reach large numbers of children in every part of the country, both within the school system (via curriculum support) and within the community (via instrumental and vocal music education). A proportion of students benefiting from music education at first and second levels will exercise the option to continue with music education into third level, i.e.'filtering up'. For some students, options will exist for further progression at post-graduate level.

At the end of the education cycle some music graduates will choose, from a range of career options, to become specialist teaching staff in the various Local Music Education Services emerging in each county and city, thereby creating a 'feed-back loop'. (This is visually represented in Diagram C, p. 19).

There are compelling economic arguments for creating such a regenerative model.

- The broad base of Local Music Education Services will ensure a good supply of students to higher levels in the educational model, to supply and sustain the educational cycle in which the state invests such significant resources.
- The product of the complete educational cycle, i.e. well-educated music graduates, will drive the future development of the music industry in Ireland which, in turn, will generate increased value to the state in revenues.
- Local Music Education Services will produce more musically educated people who, throughout their lives, are more likely to engage with and participate more fully in music and arts provision. This is directly in line with the Arts Council's strategic objective to 'Broaden and enrich participation in the arts', and its plans to 'extend and enhance the artistic experience of young people in the formal and informal education sector' which include developing and campaigning 'for proposals to achieve better arts in education.³⁸

Diagram C - Structural Model: Vertical Dimension

Illustrating how implementation of the Local Music Education Service model would achieve a logical progression ladder, via publicly-funded provision, for students wishing to study music from the first stages through to postgraduate and professional level. The model is regenerative, whereby students graduating from the upper tier (third and fourth levels) can become faculty members of Local Music Education Services and other primary and second-level music education institutions/services.

THIRD AND FOURTH LEVELS

National and regional music education institutions, IAPA, universities and colleges of education

SECOND LEVELS - LOCAL MUSIC EDUCATION SERVICES

(incorporating existing music schemes), national and regional music education institutions, second-level school music education

FIRST LEVEL - LOCAL MUSIC EDUCATION SERVICES

(incorporating existing music schemes), national music education institutions, primary school music education

Chapter 3 Educational Issues

Abstract

The creation of Local Music Education Services will combine instrumental and vocal music education delivered on an extra-curricular basis (i.e. outside of school hours) with music-curriculum support services for local schools during school hours.

This twin-track approach will ensure that state provision of music education is consistent (i.e. that the various elements, such as curriculum-based music education in the classroom and the extra-curricular instrumental and vocal music education services, are complementary) – see Diagram D, p. 23.

Music services will be organised by the county-based Local Music Education Service Partnerships (LMESPs). In order to ensure the quality of Local Music Education Services, a system for establishing national standards and implementing quality control is required. Responsibility for this should be assigned to the National Music Education Council (NMEC).

Diagram D - Educational Model

Community-based Instrumental/Vocal Education Service

- individual tuition
- group tuition
- pre-instrumental
- musicianship
- improvisation
- composition
- ensembles
- applied music making

CURRICULUM SUPPORT

in-service training workshops special projects school performances

School Music Curriculum

- listening
 composing
 performing
- Primary Curriculum - Junior Certificate - Leaving Certificate

Local Music Education Service provision
 Existing school music provision

Chapter 3 Educational Issues

3.1 Role of Local Music Education Services

In response to an invitation from NMEC, individual Local Music Education Service Partnerships (LMESPs) should prepare proposals which include their vision of the twin elements of the LMES models and how they will be delivered locally. This section addresses key issues arising.

3.1.1 Music genre

In creating an inclusive model for today and for the future, the new Local Music Education Services should provide a high quality music education capable of integrating the rich indigenous musical tradition with the cultural diversity of twenty-first-century Ireland. NMEC will therefore require individual LMESPs to accommodate multiple music genres within the twin elements of their Local Music Education Service, thereby enriching the educational value and maximising the impact and inclusiveness of the services within the local community.

Many important aspects of learning musically are not *per se* genre specific. In the case of music-curriculum support services, a multiple-genre or even cross-genre approach to music making in the classroom will offer significantly increased and enhanced opportunities for original and stimulating work. Such an approach will engage much more fully with children and will reflect their own life experiences. The use of music from a range of cultural and ethnic backgrounds, for instance, has been shown to serve as a means for racial and cultural integration within the classroom.³⁹

With regard to the instrumental and vocal music education services each LMESP should adopt a broadly-based approach to teaching, learning and music making. As is the norm with good practice, students will initially learn in one particular music genre, following the established path of acquiring the associated technical expertise together with relevant knowledge of idiom and style, repertoire and, where appropriate, musical literacy. However, the opportunity to participate in or experiment with music making from other traditions or genres should also be offered on an optional basis. For instance someone whose main focus is on learning classical percussion should be afforded the opportunity of 'trying out' other related skills, such as *bódhrán* playing in traditional Irish music, or performing in jazz or popular music styles. Many students may wish to engage in ensemble music making in more than one genre, because to do so is rewarding and educationally fulfilling, both musically and socially.

Therefore each LMESP should accommodate a broad range of musical genres including

- traditional Irish music
- 'classical' music
- music from 'popular' culture.

In addition some LMESPs may wish to include genres such as

- world musics
- 📕 jazz
- band music.

Each LMESP proposal will naturally wish to reflect the distinctive musical characteristics associated with its particular county. It must however offer a balanced music curriculum which includes music in other genres. For instance in a county with a strong background in traditional Irish music, the LMESP must provide access to classical and other music genres as well.

Once established, the model should be sufficiently flexible to respond to change either in local conditions or in broader economic, social and cultural developments.

3.1.2 Instrumental and vocal music education services

LMESPs will engage a team of music teachers with the requisite specialist skills to provide both elements of the service. Owing to the nature of the activity, instrumental and vocal specialist teachers will constitute the bulk of the staffing complement, with a smaller number of staff allocated specifically to music-curriculum support. A welcome degree of overlap between roles should arise naturally.⁴⁰

In accordance with good practice and in line with its commitment to quality, each Local Music Education Service must provide a comprehensive instrumental music service by offering tuition in a broad range of musical instruments across each of its chosen music genres. For instance in developing a comprehensive education service in classical instrumental music, each of the principal instruments of the four orchestral 'families' (strings, woodwind, brass, percussion) should be represented, together with piano and other keyboard instruments. The same approach should apply in other music genres. This approach guarantees choice and, amongst other benefits, ensures that maximum educational value can be achieved through opportunities for meaningful and properly-structured ensemble activity.

3.1.3 Course content of instrumental and vocal syllabus

Each LMESP will offer a broad-ranging music syllabus. Some subjects, considered not to be genre specific, will be offered as options to all students as part of a holistic music education. Subjects taught in this way might include

- pre-instrumental classes, musicianship classes including music literacy and aural training
- improvisation and composition
- applied music making (training musicians to be flexible performers, capable of working creatively in a variety of performance situations, e.g. in community settings, or in collaborative, cross-artform situations).

Other subjects are naturally suited to a more genre-specific approach, including

- group instrumental and vocal tuition
- individual instrumental and vocal tuition
- ensemble activity, e.g. small groups, larger bands, choirs, orchestras.

Each LMESP should ensure that, for those students wishing to study a musical instrument, participation in a broad range of otherwise optional elements from the instrumental and vocal music education syllabus is obligatory.

3.1.4 Instrumental and vocal music education service: local linkages

(i) Community-based activity

Performance is recognised as an integral element of any system of instrumental and vocal music education. The necessity to organise performance opportunities for the LMES instrumental and vocal education strand will create natural links with the local community through youth orchestras and choirs, local bands, *fleánna ceoil*, community festivals and other voluntary music and arts activities.

(ii) Link to local Arts Office

LMESPs should seek to establish a close strategic relationship with the local Arts Office which, itself, is a product of strategic co-operation between the Arts Council and the Local Authority. Significantly, Local Authority Arts Offices have the potential to be a bridge between the local arts community and the Local Music Education Service.

3.1.5 Curriculum support

Each Local Music Education Service will employ a small number of music-curriculum support specialists alongside the larger instrumental and vocal tuition team. These curriculum-support specialists will work closely with the local Education Centres, which will in turn assume responsibility for co-ordination with local primary and second-level schools. The involvement of local Education Centres will ensure that there is a professional development dimension in support of music teaching in primary and second-level schools. Curriculum-support specialists will deliver a range of services, either directly or in conjunction with classroom teachers, performers and composers, local arts organisations and local or national professional arts agencies. Numerous pilot programmes exploring good practice in this specialist area have been undertaken in recent years.⁴¹ More specifically, local curriculum-support services should include

- 1. *In-career development* for classroom teachers at primary level
- 2. Workshops: designed by the music-curriculum support team and benefiting from specialist skills of local musicians (professional composers, musicians and other artists), at both primary and second levels (including workshops offered to first and second years, as options for Transition Year and Leaving Certificate Applied, and to Junior and Leaving Certificate music students)
- **3.** *Special projects:* more ambitious and longer-term collaborative projects, perhaps involving local or national music or arts service providers, at primary and second levels
- 4. Performance: this could include opportunities for children who are students of the instrumental and vocal music education service to perform in school settings for other children. In addition performance opportunities could be created for other local or visiting musicians in schools, or in local venues. At second level, Performing, Listening and Composing are compulsory components of both the Junior and Leaving Certificate music curricula. Leaving Certificate students must choose an elective in one of these same three core disciplines. In some cases student choice may be curtailed by the lack of a comprehensive range of specialist instrumental skills among most second-level classroom music teachers, and inequitable public provision of instrumental tuition. Therefore a student wishing to specialise in Performing, in an instrument which his/her classroom music teacher is unable to teach, is currently forced to seek tuition from an external source, most likely on a private fee-paying basis. Local Music Education Services could supplement the work of second-level classroom music teachers by providing equitable access to a comprehensive range of tuition services, as an element within curriculum support.

3.1.6 Curriculum support: linkages

The music-curriculum support element of Local Music Education Services should be integrated into other aspects of support for classroom teachers in the following ways:

- The direct involvement of the Education Centre to ensure that local music-curriculum support services are aligned to national priorities such as reflected in the Primary Curriculum Support Programm (PCSP).
- 2. Aligning the curriculum-support strand to national priorities for in-career development for second-level teachers, through linking with the In-Career Development Unit of the Department of Education and Science.
- The National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) should be aware of and responsive to the work of Local Music Education Services in the design of curriculum guidelines.
- 4. Education Centres could avail of the Arts Council's Commissioning Scheme, thereby creating opportunities for composers to become professionally involved, for example by participating in curriculum-support projects with a specific compositional element. This approach could draw on the experiences gleaned from a number of pilot initiatives in curriculum support which have involved composers, both in this country and in other countries.⁴²

In addition to support for classroom teachers, the pool of resources available to music-curriculum support services could be enriched by increased provision of professional development opportunities for musicians and composers in order to broaden their specialist skills. The professional training of many musicians and composers frequently leaves them inadequately equipped to deal with the 'real-life' situations of working with groups of young people or with other community-based groups. However, the Arts Council has indicated that it wishes to work to 'improve the skill-base of good artists who wish to work in arts participation' and 'extend and enhance the arts experience of young people in the formal and informal education sector'.⁴³ Indeed some Arts Council client organisations have already begun professional development programmes for this purpose.44 Also in recent years there have been developments in the provision of third-level and postgraduate courses which focus on these issues, both in Ireland⁴⁵ and elsewhere.⁴⁶

⁴¹ For example, the National Concert Hall's In Tune programme, and projects run by Cumann Náisiúnta na gCór, Music Network, Irish Chamber Orchestra, West Cork Music, and Wexford County Council's Arts Office. For reports on some of these projects see www.musicnetwork.ie, under Publications

⁴² For example Vogler Quartet in Sligo music education project 2002 involving composer Elaine Agnew

⁴³ The Arts Plan 2002-2006, p. 14

⁴⁴ For example, Creative Arts for Everyone (CAFÉ), Music Network

⁴⁵ For example the Irish World Music Centre at the University of Limerick offers an MA in Community Music; Cork School of Music offers an elective in community music as part of its BMus degree course

The Renshaw Report (presented in 1999 to the Minister for Education and Science and the Minister for Arts, Heritage, Gaeltacht and the Islands) was adopted in 2000 as providing the basis upon which the proposed Irish Academy of Performing Arts (IAPA) would be developed. The report recommends placing Continuing Professional Development centre-stage, as part of the formative training of musicians, composers and other artists within a Centre for Creative Practice at the Academy.⁴⁷

Clearly with the emergence of NMEC, and taking into account the potential for a structural linkage to the Arts Council (see 2.1.1), an opportunity now exists to co-ordinate these developments, thereby enhancing the range of options open to LMESPs as they develop the music-curriculum support element of their services.

3.1.7 Information and Communications Technologies (ICT) in music education: new models

New approaches to teaching children to play musical instruments, including the use of Information and Communications Technologies (ICT), have recently emerged. Distance learning – utilising the internet to overcome the issue of proximity to the teaching source – may offer significant and attractive new opportunities to LMESPs, if approved by NMEC. New service providers are now offering individual tuition services in a range of traditional Irish music instruments via the internet.⁴⁸

ICT-based service provision could also be expanded to include music-curriculum support programmes. For instance county-wide special music projects utilising interactive features could be co-ordinated using internet-based technologies. Specifically NMEC could seek to establish links with the National Centre for Technology in Education (NCTE) to explore whether Schools Integration Projects (SIPs) could be developed to encompass music-curriculum support projects in line with the Department of Education and Science's ICT strategy.

3.2 Educational role of the National Music Education Council

The National Music Education Council (NMEC) will guarantee the educational integrity of the new system of Local Music Education Services by setting criteria which individual LMESPs must meet. In effect NMEC will provide a quality assurance system⁴⁹ requiring each LMESP to identify performance indicators and to establish self-evaluative mechanisms for its Local Music Education Service.

Key educational issues for NMEC would include the following:

1 Quality of teaching practice

Teaching practice will be the subject of professional assessment. Initially this will require that instrumental and curriculum-support teachers should have obtained professional qualifications approved by NMEC. In some circumstances where such qualifications are absent, an acceptable alternative 'credit' system may be put in place.

2. Professional development

NMEC will make provision for the varying specialist professional-development needs of both instrumental and vocal music education teachers and music-curriculum support teachers, including

- establishing professional networks for LMES teaching staff
- creating opportunities for professional development of teachers
- dissemination of models of good practice by the music education inspectorate.

3. Student progression

NMEC will ensure that the educational emphasis of the Local Music Education Services will be to facilitate a child's musical progression as part of a broader intellectual, artistic and imaginative development. This will involve assessments of the quality of experience and the quality of learning. While conventional methods of assessment and accreditation (such as examinations and performance-based assessment) should be agreed and employed where appropriate, NMEC will require that

⁴⁹ See sub-sections of 2.1.1 for more detail on educational criteria

other methods of assessing student progression will also be employed. This approach recognises that, whereas the nature of musical progression in many genres of music does not lend itself to assessment solely by examination-based methods, applied quality control requires some adequate form of student assessment. Such assessment should include a balanced combination of some or all of the following elements:

- continuous assessment
- in-house assessments, including a broad range of performance-based activity
- periodic in-house examinations (e.g. every third year, or at the end of an educational 'cycle') involving use of external examiners. This could involve co-operative exchange arrangements between Local Music Education Services, and/or co-operative arrangements with existing national and regional music education providers
- use of established external examination models.

4. Student selection processes

It is likely that the demand for both elements of the Local Music Education Services will be high. In the case of the instrumental and vocal music education service (which by its nature tends to involve a relatively high teacher-student ratio), demand will inevitably exceed the available supply. NMEC will require that LMESP proposals demonstrate how applicant students are to be selected for the instrumental and vocal music education service, for example by

- applying assessment procedures to ensure that the service is offered to those with the most apparent musical ability, i.e. a merit-based approach
- use of a queuing system (i.e. 'first come first served').

Classroom teachers and music-curriculum support specialists could co-operate in devising methods of assessing and selecting children from within the classroom. This would create a significant direct link between the classroom-based music-curriculum support service and the extra-curricular instrumental and vocal music education service.⁵⁰ In addition Local Music Education Services should apply appropriate policies of positive discrimination to ensure equality of access to all children.⁵¹ This would include provision for VECs to allow fee reductions or fee waiving on a discretionary basis.

5. Scale of service

NMEC will set guidelines as to the scale of the service offered, requiring LMESPs to achieve real and proportional targets for public participation in the service. The degree of genuine access to instrumental and vocal music education depends on the scale of the service offered. The 'target' approach has been adopted in some jurisdictions and, in the case of Norway for example, target participation rates (percentage of school-going children) are pre-set. In some municipalities the figure is as high as 30%.⁵² This is necessary in order to avoid the danger of demand-led provision, which would threaten the sustainability of service.⁵³

6. Scope of instrumental and vocal music education service NMEC will publish guidelines for LMESPs indicating the minimum range of services that must be offered by the local instrumental and vocal music education service. These will include:

- minimum range of instruments to be offered
- range and balance of music genres offered
- breadth of syllabus offered (i.e. including ensemble music making, aural training and other services).

7. Adult learning

NMEC will require LMESPs to indicate the manner in which they intend to include adult-learning provision within their services. This type of provision will fit naturally within the VECs, who play a leading part in the delivery of adult-learning services.⁵⁴

⁵⁰ This is similar to the method currently employed by Education and Library Board Music Services in Northern Ireland

⁵¹ In keeping with the ethos of other initiatives by the Department of Education and Science, such as Breaking the Cycle, 1996 - 2000

⁵² Trondheim Kommunale Musikk-og Kulturskole

⁵³ Jack O'Brien Report (2001), section 9.1

⁵⁵ Jack O Bhen Report (2001), section

⁵⁴ Local Adult Learning Boards are constituted as statutory sub-committees of the VECs, administratively hosted by the VECs and with the VECs capable of providing a technical service as employer of additional staff appointed to the Boards. For more information see *Local Structures in Adult Education – a Discussion Paper*, AONTAS, p. 5
Chapter 4 Resource Issues

Abstract

It is recommended that the resources required to fund Local Music Education Services be provided through an appropriate balance of central government provision (via NMEC) and local provision, to be sought by Local Music Education Service Partnerships (LMESPs). A key strength of the model is its cost-effectiveness, in that it utilises existing capital infrastructure and does not require new building work in order to be implemented. This in-kind capital provision should constitute the main local contribution to the funding model, complementing the funding sought from central government.

Key elements of this proposal include:

- The National Music Education Council (NMEC) will control the disbursement of funding from the Department of Education and Science to LMESPs. This funding will primarily cover staffing costs.
- LMESPs, including statutory agencies such as VECs and Local Authorities, will contribute capital and administrative resources, thereby complementing national funding of operational costs.
- Each LMESP will raise additional resources through grant aid, through partnership projects with community, public and private sectors, and from student fee contributions.
- Where appropriate LMESPs will seek support from international sources. For example LMESPs adjacent to the border with Northern Ireland might avail of cross-border funding.

Diagram E - Resourcing Model



Chapter 4 Resource Issues

4.1 Income

4.1.1 Central Government and other national funding

The Department of Education and Science will provide funding for the operation of Local Music Education Services. NMEC will be authorised to determine discretionary funding of LMESPs. NMEC will therefore have a dual role in providing educational quality assurance (as outlined in 2.1.1) and as a funding mechanism. The funding mechanism role will underpin and reinforce NMEC's quality-assurance role.

4.1.2 Statutory Agencies: in-kind support

School buildings will be needed for the delivery of the instrumental and vocal music education service (e.g. individual and group instrumental and vocal tuition classes, aural classes, pre-instrumental classes, musicianship classes and ensemble activity). These services will be delivered outside of school hours when building facilities become available. The provision of the curriculum-support service by contrast will be delivered in classrooms within school hours, so building facilities are not an issue.

VECs, as the key agents of local delivery for the instrumental and vocal music education component, can make a significant contribution by providing the necessary buildings. This is all the more significant given that the VEC network of school buildings offers a good geographical spread throughout the country. Where VEC buildings are not available, local agreement can be reached with management authorities for the use of other school buildings.

LMESPs should, if necessary, be in a position to provide capital facilities other than schools. As partners, Local Authorities should consider making available specialist or complementary capital facilities. This would link in to the increasingly active role played by Local Authorities in promoting local arts development, activities which are closely in line with the strategic objectives of the Arts Council.⁵⁵ For example the need for Local Music Education Services to use centrally-located buildings, typically for ensemble activity, could create opportunities for imaginative linkages between the Local Music Education Service and existing or planned local arts facilities (e.g. the LMES orchestra, choir or traditional ensemble might be permitted to rehearse and perform in the local arts centre).

4.1.3 Other grant aid and sponsorship in-kind

It is recommended that NMEC seek to develop a new initiative modelled on the Arts Council and Local Authorities' *Piano Purchase Scheme*. This is a capital programme designed to provide high quality pianos for locally authorised professional performances. A parallel scheme might be developed between NMEC and Local Authorities, perhaps in conjunction with a private sector supplier, to provide good quality instruments for teaching purposes.

In addition to seeking grant aid, investment or sponsorship from local sources (e.g. via the Local Investment Fund in eligible areas, corporate sponsorship, etc.), LMESPs should be imaginative in exploring means of adding to their resources. For instance, private sector sources such as the Irish Recorded Music Association (IRMA) Trust have already provided project funding to assist in the creation of local instrument banks.⁵⁶ LMESPs could apply to the Trust for assistance, or could take the initiative to build their own instrument bank by making county-wide calls for donations or long-term loan of instruments to be used by students availing of the Local Music Education Service.57 Such locally-based initiatives would be greatly assisted if the Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism were to intervene with a strategic policy for recycling instruments over, for example, a ten year period. This proposal is similar to the Instrument Swap scheme operated in the UK by the publicly-supported Youth Music,⁵⁸ in partnership with the BBC.

58 For further information, see www.youthmusic.org.uk

⁵⁵ See Arts Plan 2002-2006, pp 22-23

⁵⁶ For further information on this resource see www.irmatrust.ie/program/html/ibank.htm

⁵⁷ Similar to a scheme operated by the IRMA Trust

4.1.4 Fees

LMESPs will be able to earn some income by charging modest fees. However, a primary objective of the proposed model is that services will be brought within the financial means of all families, thereby ensuring access and inclusiveness.

(i) Instrumental and vocal music education

The instrumental and vocal music education strand of Local Music Education Services will involve payment of modest fees by the student and will receive sufficient public subsidy to ensure affordability and access. O'Brien (2001) addresses the level at which fees should be pitched and makes recommendations in this regard. He includes a recommendation to de-couple fees from the cost of tuition and set them at an affordable rate, perhaps inflation linked. In addition O'Brien recommends that special provision be made to ensure that families with limited financial means are not excluded, commensurate with the principle of 'ability to pay'.⁵⁹

(ii) Group activity

Each Local Music Education Service should as a matter of course offer group activity on a non-fee-paying basis to students enrolled for instrumental or vocal music education (who are therefore already contributing in part to the service). Additionally non-enrolled children who study music elsewhere (e.g. through private tuition or other community-based study) should be welcome to participate in group-based music-making opportunities in LMES orchestras, choirs and bands on a modest membership fee-paying basis, should vacancies arise.

(iii) Instrument Lending Bank

A subsidised instrument lending-bank service should be provided to students at an affordable rate. Income from lending fees would be very modest, with a minimal contribution towards instrument hire being charged. This income could be used to offset the costs of maintaining the instruments, e.g. instrument technicians' services.⁶⁰

(iv) Curriculum support

The music-curriculum support service will be offered free to every primary school and to every second-level school. No fee income will therefore be generated.

4.1.5 International Funding

Some LMESPs may seek EU funding where this is available. LMESPs from counties adjacent to the border with Northern Ireland, for example, may avail of cross-border funding. In addition, the creation of links between NMEC and an equivalent body within the Department of Education for Northern Ireland could open up the possibility of attracting funds from international sources.

4.2 Expenditure

4.2.1 Expenditure at national level

The Department of Education and Science will need to provide for an inspectorate to oversee the quality assurance role of the NMEC. It will also need to make provision for the establishment and regular meetings of a professional network for LMESP teaching staff, presenting opportunities for professional development. Funding will also need to be provided for the managerial and administrative functions of NMEC.

4.2.2 Expenditure at local level

Operating costs of the Local Music Education Services will be the responsibility of the LMESPs. The operational costs of the service will constitute the bulk of each Local Music Education Service's expenditure. Each partnership should include agencies which can make the requisite administrative infrastructures available. VECs will be ideally placed to act as employers of staff of the new Local Music Education Services.

Key areas of expenditure at local level will include staffing costs

- management and administration costs
- maintenance costs.

1. Staffing costs

Many important components of operating costs, including staffing, have been addressed authoritatively in the O'Brien Report (2001). The report was prepared at the behest of the Department of Education and Science to review existing VEC music schemes in County Cork, City of Limerick and City of Dublin (Kylemore College). The report includes specific recommendations on the costing of operational issues such as

- teacher allocation (teacher-student ratios)
- local management structures
- provision of permanent posts
- qualifications
- fee structure
- extent of service offered.

It is recommended that formulae and other recommendations contained in the O'Brien Report be adopted to inform the process of costing the proposed new model for LMESPs.

Each Local Music Education Service will provide two complementary music services: a direct public instrumental and vocal music education service to be delivered outside of school hours, and a music-curriculum support service to be delivered to schools during the school day. Each of the two strands requires staff equipped with distinct teaching skills. It will therefore be necessary to make provision for employing a range of music teachers with the requisite mix of skills to provide

- individual instrumental and vocal tuition
- group instrumental and vocal tuition
- other group activity (including ensemble activity, pre-instrumental classes, musicianship and aural training)
- curriculum support.

Other relevant issues arising include

- cross-over in teaching roles
- overall teacher allocation ratios.

(i) Individual and group-based instrumental and vocal tuition

Research and consultation conducted to inform this report has revealed support for providing a balance of

individual and group-based tuition within the proposed new instrumental and vocal tuition services.⁶¹ This recognises that the inclusion of some group tuition (which by its nature is less costly than individual tuition) will ensure that the service benefits greater numbers of children. The size of groups will vary depending on a number of factors such as the characteristics of particular instruments and/or the music genre involved.

However even though individual tuition represents a relatively expensive model of education it is widely accepted that, particularly in the case of children who have reached a certain level of technical and/or musical proficiency, this is the most appropriate model for ensuring satisfactory progress. The O'Brien Report (2001), in considering resource implications arising where a system of 1:1 instrumental tuition is employed (i.e. where individual teachers provide tuition to students on an individual basis), advocates an allocation of 2.5 - 3.0 whole time equivalent (WTE) teachers per 100 students. This recommendation should be adopted in the model proposed here.

By combining the two approaches described by O'Brien, each LMESP could develop a cost-effective model for offsetting the more costly teaching allocations for individual teaching against the less costly group instruction.

(ii) Other group-based activity

Group activity is relatively low-cost and certainly helps to offset the more expensive individual instrumental and vocal tuition. Many of the subjects on the Local Music Education Services' syllabi are likely to involve group learning and group music making and, as previously discussed, participation in certain subjects within a broad music syllabus should be obligatory for all students enrolled for instrumental and vocal tuition.⁶² For instance key elements of the syllabus (including pre-instrumental classes, musicianship classes and aural training) are normally taught in classes of up to twenty-five students. In addition ensemble activity (such as small groups, bands, choirs and orchestras) involves a relatively low teacher-pupil ratio.

(iii) Curriculum support

Curriculum-support work requires specialised music education skills which, by definition, are not required of instrumental music teachers. This report therefore recommends that each LMESP establish a small team of curriculum-support specialists as a subset of its staffing allocation. Given that the work of the music-curriculum support team will benefit all children attending primary school in the area, and all of those attending second-level schools availing of the service on offer, this constitutes a highly cost-effective element within each Local Music Education Service. Each Local Music Education Service should be required to ensure equitable distribution of its resources in this regard, e.g. by rotating the service so that all schools can benefit.

(iv) Cross-over in teaching roles

From a resource perspective it seems likely that some cross-over or overlap of teaching roles might arise. For instance some music-curriculum support specialists might also be deployed in the instrumental and vocal music education service (e.g. in delivery of aural, musicianship and pre-instrumental classes). Similarly ensemble activity, such as coaching choirs, orchestras and bands, might typically be undertaken by instrumental or vocal music education specialists. This cross-over will assist in rationalising teaching allocations within each Local Music Education Service.

2. Management and administration

In its examination of three existing VEC music schemes the O'Brien Report (2001) recommends a system of posts of responsibility modelled upon existing structures in the Prison Education Service, and includes examples of how such a system might work.⁶³ O'Brien also makes reference to the general administrative support which VECs are capable of offering. These recommendations should form the basis of a management and administration system for the model advocated in this report. LMESPs will also benefit from the participation of other statutory agencies such as Local Authorities and Education Centres, which can offer additional administrative support.

3. Maintenance costs

LMESPs will need to make provision for costs associated with the use, maintenance and upkeep of buildings in which they deliver the Local Music Education Service. These costs will include overheads such as heating, lighting, and ancillary staffing (e.g. porters).

Chapter 5 Implementation Plan

Abstract

Subject to acceptance of this report, an intensive preparatory process will be necessary to ensure that the proposed National Music Education Council (NMEC) is established on a firm footing and that the development of Local Music Education Services can begin as soon as possible.

Implementation of this model would be best served by the establishment under the auspices of the Department of Education and Science of an Implementation Group which would begin its work early in 2003.

An outline Critical Path of this preparatory process is provided in Diagram F, p. 39. The first step involves the creation of the Implementation Group, which will move the process from Stage 1 (the feasibility study) into Stage 2 (the set-up).

	STAGE 3 - IMPLEMENTATION	NMEC maintains a quality-assurance role via: • ongoing evaluation of established Local Music Education Services • guardianship role regarding new LMESP proposals for subsequent phases of the implementation plan • creation of networking and professional development opportunities for staff of LMESs.	Initial establishment of a designated number of LocAL Music Ebucarion Services which include provision for: a subsidised instrumental/ vocal music education service. ERVICES	
Diagram F - Critical Path		 Establishment of the NMEC as an official body set up under the auspices of the Department of Education and Science. NMEC's initial tasks will include: Publishing guidelines to assist LMESPs in preparation of proposals lssuing a call for applications from LMESPs for participation in the initial phase of the LMES programme Negotiating agreements with a designated number of LMESPs in the first phase, including criteria for evaluation and review Recommending to government on the full implementation of subsequent phases of the programme. 	Establishment of a number of LMESPs, as working groups of City/County Development Boards. Each LMESP will include representatives of: The city/county VEC regional Education Centre City/County VEC Primary and second-level schools Primary and second-level schools IMESPs submit proposal to NMEC outlining the scale and content of the LMESPs submit proposal to NMEC outlining the scale and content of the LOCal Music Educations with NMEC, successful LSEMPs qualify for central government funding to establish their Local Music Education Service.	
	Stage 2– Set-up	 IMPLEMENTATION GROUP IS FORMED EARLY IN 2003, UNDER THE AUSPICES OF THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE. The Implementation Group will include management, music and education, and should include representatives of: The Department of Education and Science The Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism The Arts Council Music education institutions Music organisations covering a range of genres. The Implementation Group's main role will be to set out a timeframe and conduct the necessary preparatory work for the establishment of the new National Music Education strategy 	 Expert Working Expert Working Expert Working Enucational Issues Issues Issues such as: Local Music Local Music Cocal Music Local Music Local Music Local Music Extericulation Service Staffing allocations and content (instrumental/vocal (instrumental/vocal (instrumental/vocal (instrumental/vocal (instrumental/vocal (instrumental/vocal Costing the service Costing the service at national level Establishing a timetable for phased delivery of LMESs. 	
	STAGE 1 – FEASIBILITY STUDY STAGE	 May 2001 – Minister for Arts, Heritage, Gaeltacht and the Islands agrees to fund Music Network feasibility study into the creation of a national system of locally memb delivered, publicly-subsidised music education services June 2001 – feasibility study research and consultation phases begin December 2001 – 1st meeting of feasibility study advisory group June 2002 – report writing begins February 2003 – feasibility study report is presented to the Minister for Arts, Sport and Tourism and the Minister for Education and Science. The document is then publicly launched in Dublin 	EXPERT WC GROUP ON EDUCATION ISSUES recommend issues such a med conte (instrume tuition se curriculu service) Cuality a mechanis Fudent s processes	2002 2003
	CURRENT SITUATION	 School Music Curricula Curricula Tet and 2nd levels) VEC music education schemes Tet and 2nd levels) National Institutions e.g. DIT, CIT, RIAM Private music schools and teachers (mostly 1st and 2nd levels) University and other 3rd level music / music education courses IAPA interim governing body's planning work 		2001

Chapter 5 Implementation Plan

5.1 Establishment of the Implementation Group

The members of the Implementation Group should combine between them the range of skills and specialist knowledge required to implement the model. Their knowledge and skills should be particularly evident in matters relating to

- music
- education
- finance, local government, strategic management and other relevant technical areas.

In order to sustain the vision and philosophy which has informed this report there should be some overlap between the membership of the Implementation Group and the membership of the Advisory Group which was part of the process of conducting the feasibility study.

Membership of the Implementation Group should therefore include

(i) Nominees from

- The Department of Education and Science
- The Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism
- The Arts Council

(ii) Representatives of the music education sector including

- representatives of music education institutions
- representatives of classroom teachers at both primary and second levels
- (iii)Representatives of the music sector: with specific expertise in a range of music genres, including classical and traditional Irish music

It is recommended that the Department of Education and Science should make provision for appropriate research and administrative support to assist the Implementation Group in conducting its work.

5.2 Role of the Implementation Group

The primary task of the Implementation Group will be to conduct the preparatory work necessary to establish a new National Music Education Council (NMEC). The group should conclude its work by handing over responsibility for this project to NMEC. The work of the Implementation Group is therefore likely to comprise the following activities.

- Establishing and appointing membership of two expert working groups to carry out additional work on the core issues identified within this report:
- educational
- structural and resourcing.

Each expert working group will make recommendations to the Implementation Group regarding specific issues. The working group on **educational issues** will make recommendations on issues such as

- educational guidelines and criteria upon which prospective LMESPs will base their submissions to NMEC (as discussed in 2.1.1 and 3.2)
- the quality-assurance role of NMEC in regard to the twin educational strands (instrumental and vocal music education and music-curriculum support services) to be offered by LMESPs.

The working group on **structural and resourcing issues** will make equivalent detailed recommendations covering matters such as

- Structural relationship between NMEC and the Department of Education and Science
- Resourcing relationship between NMEC and the Department of Education and Science including funding conduits to be established between the Department of Education and Science, NMEC and selected LMESPs
- Provision for funding the work of NMEC, including an inspectorate, management team and administrative support

- Relationship of NMEC to relevant existing and planned national bodies, including the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, the Primary Curriculum Support Programme, the Teaching Council, the Examination Commission and the Arts Council
- Relationship between NMEC and an appropriate body within the Department of Education for Northern Ireland
- Using the recommendations of the O'Brien report as a costing basis for staffing and resourcing requirements of individual LMESPs
- Costing the phased introduction of LMESPs in the context of the indicated Critical Path.
- 2. Determining appropriate performance indicators and evaluation criteria for review of individual LMESPs.
- 3. Developing a Critical Path for the phased introduction of the national system of LMESPs.⁶⁴
- 4. Making recommendations to the Minister for Education and Science on the membership of NMEC. Ideally this will involve some overlap with the membership of the Implementation Group in order to ensure continuity of vision and purpose. The membership of NMEC should be constituted in a manner similar to that of the Implementation Group and should be drawn from
- The Department of Education and Science
- The Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism
- The Arts Council
- Representatives of the music education sector, including music education institutions and representatives of the primary and second-level teaching professions
- Representatives of specialist music organisations, comprising a broad range of genre-specific expertise.

5.3 Establishment of National Music Education Council

Upon completion of the Implementation Group's work, NMEC will be established, thereby taking the illustrated Critical Path into Stage 3.

Initial tasks of the new body will be as follows.

- Issue a call to prospective LMESPs for submission of proposals to participate in the first phase of the new Local Music Education Services.⁶⁵ The call for submissions will be supported by the publication of specific guidelines.
- Negotiate agreements with a designated number of LMESPs who will participate in the first phase of the new Local Music Education Services. Set criteria for evaluation and review and co-operate over the startup of each Local Music Education Service.
- Following appropriate evaluation, recommend to government the full implementation of subsequent phases of the programme.

Bibliography

Irish Sources

Aontas, 2002 Local Structures in Adult Education – a Discussion Paper

Arts Council/An Chomhairle Ealaíon, 2002 The Arts Plan 2002-2006

Beausang, Ita, 2002 Changes in Music Education in Ireland Journal of Music in Ireland Vol. 2, Nos. 4 and 5

Department of Education and Science, 1998 A National Educational Psychological Service, Report of Planning Group

Department of Education and Science/NCCA, 2000 Leaving Certificate Applied: Arts Education – Music

Department of Environment and Local Government, 1998 Task Force on Integration of Local Government and Local Development Systems, Report

Fitzpatrick, John, 2001 Report prepared on the County Cork School of Music in accordance with the terms of reference on the Review of Music Provision in City of Dublin, City of Limerick and County Cork VEC Schemes (unpublished)

Forum for Music in Ireland, 2001 Music in the Primary School: Submission to the Minister for Education and Science (unpublished)

Government of Ireland, 2000 Breaking the Cycle – A Celebration of Learning through the Arts, Department of Education and Science

Government of Ireland, 2000 Breaking the Cycle – The Day the President Came, Department of Education and Science

Government of Ireland, 1991 *Junior Certificate Music Syllabus*, Department of Education and Science Government of Ireland, 1996 Leaving Certificate Music Syllabus (Higher and Ordinary Level), Department of Education and Science/NCCA

Government of Ireland, 1999 Primary School Curriculum - Music

Hardiman, T.P. (Chairman), 1999 Report of the Cork School of Music Review Group

Heneghan, Frank, 2001 MEND Report: A Review of Music Education in Ireland, Incorporating the Final Report of the Music Education National Debate (MEND – Phase III)

Heneghan, Frank, 2002 The MEND Report: What Next for Irish Music Education? Journal of Music in Ireland Vol. 2, No. 6, Sept./Oct. 2002

Herron, Donald, 1985 Deaf Ears? A Report on the Provision of Music Education in Irish Schools

Irish Sports Council, 2000 A New Era for Sport – the Irish Sports Council's Strategy 2000-2002

Kitterick, Pat, 2001 Address to the Plenary Meeting of the Forum for Music in Ireland (unpublished)

Martin, Micheál TD, 2000 Announcement of the Establishment of an Irish Academy for the Performing Arts

Music Education Action Group, 2002 Music Education: The Poor Relation (unpublished)

Music Network, 1996 The Boydell Papers

Music Network, 1998 Kerry Music Report: An Overview of Music in Kerry Music Network, 1999 Waterford Music Report: An Overview of Music in Waterford City and County

National Association of Principals and Deputy-Principals, 2001 *The Arts in our Schools*

Nolan, Rachel, 1998

A Comparative Analysis of Instrumental Teaching Provision in the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland and Denmark – MPhil thesis (unpublished)

O'Brien, Jack, 2001

Review of Music Provision in the City of Dublin, City of Limerick and County Cork Vocational Education Committee Schemes (unpublished)

O'Conor/Horgan/Keating/Kinsella/O'Grady, 1996 The PIANO Report – Report to the Minister for Arts, Culture and the Gaeltacht on the Provision and Institutional Arrangements Now for Orchestras and Ensembles

Phelan, Helen, 1997 Listening Ears: A Report on Private Schools of Music in the Republic of Ireland (unpublished)

Renshaw, Peter, 1999 Proposal for an Irish Academy of Performing Arts (unpublished)

International Sources

City of Belfast School of Music, 2002 Prospectus 2002-2003

Cutietta/Hamann/Miller-Walker, 1995 Spin-offs: The Extra-Musical Advantages of a Musical Education

European Music School Union, 1995 Music Schools in Europe

European Music School Union, 1999 Statistical Information about the European Music School Union

European Music School Union, 1999 Weimar Declaration – Music Schools in Europe

Fawkes, Richard, 2002 Putting the Music Back *Classical Music, 25 May 2002, pp 12, 13*

Federation of Music Services/National Association of Music Educators, 1998 A Common Approach – A Framework for an Instrumental/Vocal Curriculum

ISME (International Society for Music Education) Music of the World's Cultures: Policy, and Declaration of Beliefs

National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education, 2000 All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education

German Music Council, Deutscher Musikrat Inter Nationes, 1994 *Music Training in Germany: A Survey*

Youth Music (UK) 2002 Creating a Land with Music

Feasibility Study Advisory Group Members

Ita Beausang Music Consultant

Martin Drury Theatre Director and Arts Consultant (Chairman)

Tom Fitzgerald Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism

Oliver Hynes Department of Education and Science

Pat Kitterick Department of Education and Science

Mel Mercier University College, Cork

Deirdre McCrea Music Network

Nollaig Ó Fiongháile Arts Council

John O'Kane Music Network

Adrian Petcu Cork School of Music

Nuala Turner Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism The following people were previous Advisory Group members and attended a number of meetings before being relocated within their organisations or moving on to take up new career opportunities.

Janet Lacey Department of Arts, Heritage, Gaeltacht and the Islands

Seamus Lynam Department of Arts, Heritage, Gaeltacht and the Islands

Christine Sisk Department of Arts, Sport and Tourism

Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

Thirty-Third Ordinary Session

Recommendation 929 (1981)*

On music education for all

The Assembly,

- Having noted the report of its Committee on Culture and Education on music education for all (Doc. 4760);
- 2. Believing music, in all its forms, to be an important means of human expression and also an accepted part of the cultural heritage of Europe;
- 3. Wishing to encourage the continuing development of this heritage through aids to contemporary music creativity, but also concerned that every individual should be enabled to develop a critical appreciation of music and, where possible, the ability of musical self-expression whether in singing or playing an instrument or in its interpretation in related cultural activity such as dancing;
- 4. Convinced that music education, in addition to the provision of special training for particularly gifted children, should be recognised as forming a continuous part of general education in all countries;
- Stressing the importance of music education and the discipline of music training for the development of the individual's total personality and cultural behaviour;
- Pointing out also the contribution music can make in remedial education, and underlining its positive social value as a leisure pursuit;
- Noting with interest that the results of research have shown that music education can make a direct contribution to performance in other subjects taught in school;

- 8. Noting the omnipresence of music in modern society in particular through the mass media, and stressing the need for young people to be able to discriminate within this constant acoustic bombardment;
- 9. Welcoming, however, the opportunities offered by the present availability of music in all forms, and the increasing interest shown in music over the last two decades by young people and adults, many of whom are seeking training in singing or instrumental playing;
- 10.Recalling its Resolution 624 (1976) on the democratic renewal of the performing arts and Recommendation 781 (1976) on Council of Europe action for the future of the performing arts;
- Welcoming the recognition of the importance of music education as part of government policy, shown by the European Ministers with responsibility for Cultural Affairs in Resolution No. 1 of their 3rd Conference (Luxembourg, 1981);
- 12.Regretting, however, the low priority placed on music education in many member countries, and particularly concerned lest present provision for music education in primary and secondary schools be cut back in the interests of reducing government spending;
- 13. Drawing attention to the vast turnover in the music industry, and hoping that some of the profits made might be redistributed to support the training of musicians and to improve public appreciation of music;
- 14. Believing that the number of music schools in member countries is inadequate to meet the need for specialized vocal and instrumental training alongside primary and secondary education;
- 15. Regretting the lack of sufficient general or specialized teachers competent to teach music, as a result of inadequate teacher-training, outmoded techniques and the lack of incentives for potential music teachers in view of their poor employment prospects;

 Assembly debate on 8 October 1981 (19th Sitting) (See Doc. 4760 report of the Committee on Culture and Education). Text adopted by the Assembly on 8 October 1981 (19th Sitting). 16. Recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

- a. prepare a recommendation on music education for all, calling on member governments to ensure:
- that parents are aware of the importance of the musical interpretation of sounds for children from birth, and that they are given guidelines on their role in developing such perception;
- ii. that music education is provided on a continuous basis in all schools from pre-school to the end of secondary education;
- iii. that sufficient special schools be maintained with an even distribution throughout each country to cater for children with a special interest in, or talent for music, and which can prepare them for a school-leaving examination in music;
- iv. that the teachers and facilities in such specialized schools are also made available to assist music education in general schools;
- that provision is made for adult education either through distance teaching courses, evening classes, or adult education institutions;
- vi. that attention is paid to the training of teachers of music, and in particular
- that the training of pre-school and primary teachers includes music;
- that provision is made for the training of sufficient specialized music teachers for secondary schools and adult education;
- that in-service training in music is provided for established teachers with stress on the relevance of music to other disciplines;
- that effective contact is maintained between teachers (both general and specialized), universities or research institutions, and training courses for teachers, so that music education constantly reflects both the experience of teaching music, and new musical developments;
- vii. that the status of music school teachers and the conditions of their employment is recognized as equivalent to those of music teachers in general schools;
- viii. that agreement be reached on the recognition of equivalences of music degrees and diplomas throughout Europe;

- ix. that greater use is made of the mass media (radio, television, records, tapes or cassettes) in music education, and of other technological developments;
- that encouragement is given to the composition of contemporary music that does not require too high a standard either for appreciation or performance and can be used by those learning music;
- xi. that support be provided for amateur performances (in particular by youth orchestras, pupils at music schools, choirs, etc.) and also for performances of touring professional groups in classrooms or to young people throughout all countries;
- xii. that innovations and pilot projects in music be introduced and encouraged at all levels;
- ask the Council for Cultural Co-operation to give consideration, in the context of its future work on the culture industries, to the possibility of redistributing for educational ends some of the profits made by the music industry;
- c. report to the Assembly in the course of European Music Year 1985 on the progress made towards the implementation of this recommendation.

The Music Education National Debate (MEND) and the Music Network feasibility study into the provision of instrumental/vocal tuition in Ireland By Frank Heneghan

Preamble

To be human is to be musical. Even more provocatively, to be musical is to be human. Music is given only to man. It lives primarily through performance. To assume that either can survive without music education is nonsense. Education without an underlying philosophy is at best a gamble, at worst a travesty. These facts are derivable as much by instinct as by logic. Stravinsky warns us that 'instinct does not lie; if it does it is not instinct'. So why has the Irish population at large accurately and intuitively divined, for more than a century, that music education is synonymous with instrumental tuition, and why have some music educators and their political overlords demurred? Why is music education in Ireland so problematic? The answer is simply because of conceptual confusion and its exploitation. The Report of the Music Education National Debate (MEND) sought to address these questions. Inexorably, but without preconceptions, it transmuted and reduced them to a single issue, from the understanding and solution of which amelioration could be predicted to follow. The challenge is comprehensively to demystify the role of performance as the central driving force of the whole musical enterprise. It is not surprising that other agencies should have arrived at the same conclusion, significantly without recourse to a gargantuan research initiative such as MEND. It matters little where the idea originated, or who takes credit for it, provided it moves on to action and to the garnering of committed political advocacy. We should rather celebrate independent discovery and unanimity of purpose. There have been many initiatives in recent years aimed at the provision of a satisfactory network of instrumental (taken, throughout this article, to include vocal) training in Ireland, the most recent being the submission to Government by the Music Education Action Group (MEAG) in June 2002. It should not be

deemed superfluous that Music Network, offering honest brokerage, so to speak, should simultaneously have succeeded in engaging the interest of Government as manifest in a commission to carry out a feasibility study into the provision of a nation-wide service. It is the aim of this document to show that the initiatives of *MEND* and Music Network in this regard are totally and fortuitously complementary, one in providing philosophical underpinning, the other in execution.

The Notion of Advocacy

The accusation that music educators have failed to promote their subject effectively may be a bitter pill to swallow, but the time may be ripe to decriminalize the faceless civil servants and the political system often fatuously held responsible for the perceived sorry state of music education. It is all too easy to shift the blame. It is the hubris of musicians, especially teachers (and instrumental teachers in particular), to be self-righteous in believing that their 'product' needs no advocacy ... that the world should come to them. The consequence is that music teaching has become one of the Cinderellas of education. The fact that practically-based musicians are understandably biased towards the psychomotor and affective aspects of their work, partially to the detriment of the cognitive, may account for, without excusing, their notorious ineptitude in the thoughtful skills of advocacy. Simple psychologically-based questions as to the nature of music and its value in education, or why instrumental tuition is so important, usually find them less convincing than their colleagues in other branches of education. The inevitable result of this is to place crucial decision-making in the hands of those who do not fully understand the issues involved but who are not fully culpable on that account. They are acting on the basis of the information fed to them; if this is philosophically weak what can we expect? The time for change is at hand and it is probable that the Music Network initiative may at last be poised for a breakthrough which will establish a better rapport and working relationship between educators, strategic policy-makers and curricular architects, based on informed and trustworthy professionalism.

The MEND Report

The MEND Report, sub-titled A Review of Music Education in Ireland, is the fruit of 17 years of research. It is a response to the Arts-Council-sponsored Deaf Ears? report of 1985, which confirmed the precarious state of school music education in this country, its seminal statement being that 'the young Irish person has the worst of all European musical "worlds"'. The MEND Report addresses the manifold problems associated with the whole spectrum of music education. In the course of a lengthy analysis and rationalization, concentrating on a potentially damaging global debacle in relation to philosophical thinking, the report eventually isolated two items of immediate relevance to Ireland.

One is a self-perpetuating need – for a forum for musical dialectic; the other is a continuing reappraisal of the nature of the performance mode in music education. The first of these needs has been met; the Forum for Music in Ireland is now functional and maturing in influence. The second encapsulates, inter alia, the subject of the Music Network enquiry.

For aficionados and those with a professional interest in Irish music education, the MEND Report is essential reading. This is because it collates and rationalizes the views of the widest imaginable spectrum of Irish music educators while sampling the wisdom of distinguished internationally recognized colleagues. The CD-ROM version (a colossal 8 Megabyte document), which is freely available (see below for details), is well laced with hyperlinks and other devices to facilitate navigation. An informative article, What Next in Irish Music Education, which appeared in the September/October 2002 issue of the Journal of Music in Ireland (JMI), attempts to summarize the main thrusts of MEND thinking. The current article, which is seen as a preface to the other two, was commissioned by Music Network as part of its consultative process, and appeals to those who would welcome the stimulation of their curiosity to delve more deeply. Here the defining parameters of the malaise in Irish music education are being searched out, in particular those that might, when pondered with a view to their significance, usefully contribute to the impact of the imminent Music Network report.

The performance issue is covered in Sections 19.7.8 and 20.3 (Recommendation No 25) of the MEND Report.

The Irreducible Essence of the Problem

The Music Network approach is a very focused and admirably reductionist view, honed to a single issue. But the broader issues react and interpenetrate one with another. The following simplified nexus must be considered in any holistic view of the dilemma.

- Music education (ME) must be divided into general education and specialist training (which are very different) and third-level education (including the training of teachers).
- 2. The commanding resources in ME are the supply and the expertise of teachers. This professional stream has to be safeguarded, especially at the recruitment stage.
- 3. It was convincingly established at *MEND* that the three burning questions in ME, at global level, are
- i) The reconciliation of pop and 'high culture' music in general education.
- ii) The role of multicultural music education.
- iii) The nature and demands of performance in education, especially as between general and specialized streams.
- 4. There is no evidence that a philosophy of music education contextualized to Irish circumstances has ever been addressed, systematically formulated and promulgated as a model to inform curricular planning, much less agreed, even on a consensus basis. The MEND Report has addressed this issue exhaustively.
- 5. There is a historically-based and damaging dichotomy between practical and academic musicians.
- 6. The design of the curriculum must be sensitive to the time demands of its activities and its aspirational diversity.

In commenting en bloc on these parameters it will be seen that there is a reciprocal impact between all of them and performance, making it a crucial factor in philosophical advocacy and in practice. Responding, it is true, to rigour of definition and honesty in standardsetting, performing as a 'proficient' or 'expert' musician demands physical skill, inter alia. It is therefore implacably time-dependent. It follows that it cannot be accommodated, except in an exploratory way, within the time constraints of school music. Current attempts to do so, in a new phase of curricular reform, are known to be causing a noticeable drop in overall standard in the music programme and difficulties at the second/third-level interface (this is dealt with in a very frank appraisal by Dr Barra Boydell [The Music Debate: Third-level Music and the Leaving Certificate] in the May/June 2001 issue of the JMI); these experiments may be viewed as an (unsuccessful) exercise to vindicate official action as claiming to cater for the performance element within school music. Surely this predicates, yet again, the need for specialist training for the sizeable minority prepared to make the necessary investment of time and energy, and not necessarily with the expectation of a free dispensation.

And it is not élitism to claim that performance is not for all; it is rather for those who are voluntarily committed to it. The time-honoured one-to-one method of training performers is expensive and need not be demanded within the school curriculum or out of school budgets. But some form of subvention should be available to encourage it. It was, rather surprisingly, unanimously agreed at MEND that all candidates for undergraduate courses in music should have some proficiency on an instrument. All of this points to the urgent need for a training scheme which is available, accessible and affordable. Proficiency in performing, like other physically-based skills, is not something that can be acquired easily, beginning in adolescence . . . all the more reason why the provision be made nation-wide, now, at primary and second level.

On the question of philosophical underpinning we should be heartened that the nature and value of music are accepted politically. After all, we have political commitment to curricular reform in school music and

to the establishment of an academy for the performing arts (IAPA) at professional level. On the other hand when the derivative philosophy of music education is under consideration we enjoy considerably less stability; this is most problematic in the apathy about discriminating performance training which has always dogged our dispensation. It is worth repeating that Department of Education fears about the budgetary implications of a free dispensation are due largely to a failure in advocacy, a dearth of understanding of the nature of the problem, and of the proffered philosophical arguments being advanced effectively to remove it - to the ultimate benefit of all branches of music education. At least primary and second-level general music programmes are in place, and can be modified, whatever their current and ongoing shortcomings; the problem here is a failure to recognize the differences between the intended, taught/implemented and delivered curriculum. Progress on the IAPA is painfully slow for alarming reasons, again of conceptual failure, that are exposed, with accuracy and an admirable disdain for political correctness, by Richard Pine in his Journal of Music in Ireland (Mar/April 2002) hard-hitting piece In Dreams Begins Responsibility. The nub of the argument here is that the IAPA has little chance of succeeding while an infrastructure (inter alia, the supply of candidates, particularly from Ireland [if the institution is to have any credibility as a national resource]) is lacking. This issue is also exhaustively treated in the MEND Report.

If there is one significant piece in the jigsaw of Irish music education that is still missing, it is the provision of specialist vocal/instrumental training which is generally available (on a countrywide basis), accessible and affordable. The current lacuna is placing the school curriculum under impossible time constraints and is making demands on teachers that they just cannot meet from traditional training. It is at the root of the misunderstanding of the totally different demands which specialized instrumental training and general music education make on teachers and learners. Worse, it will also ensure that the IAPA is stillborn as far as music is concerned. At last, it seems, Government is prepared to be convinced that this difference of approach to music education really does exist and that until something is done about it, music education will continue to have insurmountable problems in both areas (school and IAPA) already theoretically provided for. The notional subdivision of music education, mentioned above, into components with differing aims (see 1. above) is helpful in showing that it is only when all three are supported, individually healthy and interacting one with another, while celebrating their differences, that collective stability can be established.

Conclusion

It is not a question of making provision in line with other countries of the European Union merely to protect our national pride, though musicians might claim that any reason is good enough if it achieves the objective set. Music education is too important an issue to be driven by less than worthy motives. We must be convinced that what we do is at last responding to sound philosophical principles, freed from post-colonial dependence and a penny-pinching mentality that will serve our youth ill. We now have a chance, with Government encouragement, to re-identify the parameters of a truly viable music education system, one which places an anchoring emphasis where it should be. There is absolutely no need why a countrywide network of instrumental training should impinge deleteriously on the workings of what is already in place; on the contrary, only good can accrue from it. All thinking musicians should rally to the support of what the Music Network report must ineluctably recommend.

Copyright F. Heneghan Reprinted with authorial permission

Contributors to Consultation Process

Contributors from within Ireland

Allen, Joe Anderson, Mary Armitage, Mary Bailey, Gerardette Beausang, Ita Boydell, Barra Brady, Bernie Brennan, Paul

Ahern, Maureen

Brennan, Sara Breslin, Clare Brosnan, Paddy Buckley, John Byrne, Celine Calef, Iosef Campbell, Elaine Cáp, Jan Carey, Marie

Carroll, Michael J.

Carroll, Sharon Carter, Ashlyn Cavanagh, James

Chilton, John Chilton, Yvonne Chungh, Teerth Clarke, Geraldine Cleary, Annette Conaghan, Dorothy Conaghan, Enid Connolly, Jim Connolly, Sinead

Corcoran, Sharon Corr, Angela Corrigan, Caoimhín Cotter, Geraldine Cox, David Harold Coyne, Fiona Cahir Castle Arts Society Department of the Environment and Local Government West Dublin Youth Orchestras Donegal School of Music Arts Officer, Meath County Council Music Education Action Group National University of Ireland, Maynooth Aontas National Council for Curriculum and Assessment

Department of Education and Science Sliabh Luachra Rural Development Group Sligo Music Association

Royal Irish Academy of Music St. Brigid's College, Callan Cork School of Music Ronanstown Music and Drama Programme Headford Branch Comhaltas Ceoltóirí Éireann

Scoil Mhuire, Rathstewart Irish Association of Music Schools Royal Irish Academy of Music Accordion Association of Ireland Accordion Association of Ireland Draíocht Ltd., Blanchardstown Bailieborough School of Music

Young Dublin Symphonia British Kodály Academy ESB West Clare Jazz School Youth and Community Arts Officer, Dublin City Council Tinahely Courthouse Arts Centre West Dublin Youth Orchestras Arts Officer, Carlow County Council

University College Cork Sports Council of Ireland

Creedon, Margaret Crowley, Noreen Culloty, Liz Delamare, Philip Dempsey, Michael De Paor, Eibhlín Doherty, Marion Dorgan, Angela Doyle, Niall Duffy, Terre Duffy, Paddy Dunphy, Philip Durnin, Patricia Eaton, Maura Farrell, Eibhlis Farrell, Marie Fitzpatrick, John Flanagan, Gerard Flanagan, Madeleine Fleming, Pauline Flynn, Brendan Flynn, Chris Fox, lan Fuller, Anne Garrett, Carmel Gaston, Philip Gillen, Gerard Gormley, Martin Grant, Evelyn Grant, Gearóid Guilfoyle, Ronan Hanney, Carol Hart, Catherine Harten, Brian Hayden, Bernadette Hazelkorn, Ellen Heneghan, Frank Hennessy, Donal Herron, Donald Hogan, Annemarie Horgan, Jim Humphrys, Francis Hunt, Fionnuala Hussey, Tom

Ingoldsby, Marion

Judge, Maria

Togher Music Project Belltable Arts Centre, Limerick Arts Officer, Roscommon County Council Galway Arts Centre Údarás na Gaeltachta St. Patrick's College, Drumcondra Federation of Music Collectives RTÉ Music Department Arts Officer, Leitrim County Council **Right Word Company** Fermoy Confraternity Band Jeunesses Musicales Ireland Music Board of Ireland Dundalk Institute of Technology Linenhall Arts Centre, Castlebar County Cork School of Music Kylemore College of Music Music For Galway Clifden Community Arts Group Brass Band Registry of Ireland AXA Dublin International Piano Competition Galway Youth Orchestra Maoin Cheoil an Chláir National University of Ireland, Maynooth County Donegal VEC Cork School of Music Interim Governing Body, IAPA Newpark Music Centre Bray Music Centre Croghan Enterprise Company Ltd. Arts Officer. Dundalk Urban District Council Kildare International School of Excellence for Young Musicians Dublin Institute of Technology Music Education National Debate Christ the King Girls' NS, Cabra West Cork Chamber Music Festival

Interim Governing Body, IAPA County Galway VEC

Cork School of Music

Contributors from within Ireland (Contd)

Kearney, Aiveen Kearns, Hubert Keegan, Niall

Kelemen, Maria Kelly, Catherine Kelly, Nuala Kelly, Rita Kennedy, Fergus Kennelly, Kate Kenny, Dawn Kent, Artemis Kilkelly, John Lamb, Eleanor Lawlor, Áine Leonard, Joe Leonard, Jerome Liddane, James D. Lundstrom, Karina MacMahon, Brian McAuliffe, Mary McCabe, Tommy McCarthy, Anne McCarthy, Patricia McCarthy, Una McCluskey, Larry McCue, Ken McLachlan, John McLaughlin, Marie McNamara, Bill McNamara, Brian McWatt, Aidan Madden, Maura Mahon, Anita Mahon, Robert Mangan, Tommy Marshall, Mary Maxwell, Donal Mayer, Gabriela Merriman, Victor Milner, Hilda Molloy, Rosaleen Moloney, Colette Mooney, David Morgan, Brenda Moriarty, Michael

Cork School of Music Sligo County Council Irish World Music Centre, University of Limerick Young European Strings School of Music Arts Officer, Westmeath County Council County Laois School of Music

Arts Officer, Longford County Council Arts Officer, Kerry County Council

Bray Music Centre

Simply Music Primary Curriculum Support Programme Sligo VEC Department of Education and Science International Songwriters Assoc. Ltd. National Chamber Choir Irish Pipe Band Association Arts Officer, Sligo County Council IBEC Music Industry Group Arts Officer, Mayo County Council Cork School of Music

County Monaghan VEC Arts Ltd. Association of Irish Composers PCSP Flowing Tide School of Music DIT Conservatory of Music and Drama

Trinity College London Music Examinations

Mangan Guitar and Keyboard Centre

Royal School of Church Music, Ireland Cork School of Music

Newpark Music Centre Arts Officer, Wexford County Council Charleville School of Music DIT Conservatory of Music and Drama Scoil Bhríde, Donaghmede Irish Vocational Education Assoc.

Mulcahy, Olive **Orff Society** Mulcahy, Siobhán Arts Officer, Clare County Council Mullen, Maurice Comhaltas Ceoltóirí Éireann, **Clontarf Branch** Donegal School of Music Murphy, Concepta Murphy, Jerry Sligo County Band Murphy, Joe St. John's Arts and Heritage Centre, Listowel Murphy, John Gerard Murphy, Laura Murphy, Regina St. Patrick's College, Drumcondra NCCA Nesbitt, Jill Newsome, Anthony IntroArt Nic Cráith, Deirbhile Irish National Teachers' Organisation Ní Chonaill, Muireann Arts Officer, Laois County Council Ní Dhuibhir, Máire **Music Matters** Nolan, Mary Cross of Passion School, Kilcullen Nolan, Conor Arts Officer, Waterford City Council O'Carolan Summer School Noone, Paraic O'Brien, Brendan O'Brien, Conor O'Brien, Jack O'Brien, Kevin O'Brien, Lisa O'Brien, Michele Dublin Youth Orchestras Summer Course O'Brien, Sarah South Kerry Development Partnership O'Carroll, Seán Co. Limerick VEC O'Connor, John Cork School of Music O'Connor, Nuala Music Board of Ireland O'Conor, John Royal Irish Academy of Music O'Connell, David Municipal School of Music, Limerick Ó Cuinneagáin, Liam Cearolann Seaniois/Faeadog Department of Education and Science O'Donoghue, Gary O'Dwyer, Cecilia Ursuline Convent, Thurles Ó Fearraigh, Mícheál Údarás na Gaeltachta O'Flynn, John Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick Ó Gráda, Conal Scoiltrad O'Grady, Larissa O'Hora, Catríona O'Kane, Agnes Irish Association of Youth Orchestras Forum for Music in Ireland O'Kelly, Eve **Contemporary Music Centre** Forum for Music in Ireland Ó Longáin, Seán County Donegal VEC

Contributors from within Ireland (Contd)

Scoiltrad

Ó Rabhaigh, Eoin O'Reilly, Catríona O'Reilly, Jim Organ, Margaret O'Riordan, Conor O'Riordan, Evelyn O'Riordan, Patricia Ó Rócháin, Muiris O'Sullivan, Miriam O'Sullivan, Tom

O'Toole, Michael

Petcu-Colan, Ioana Phelan, Helen

Petcu, Adridan

Reilly, Eithne

Rice, Ronan

Roe, Paul

Ryan, Pat

Sheehan, Ciara Smith, Pamela

Spratt, Geoffrey

Sweeney, Eamon

Townsend, Declan Wall, John

Szucs, Ferenc

Taylor, Frank Toher, Tom

Wall, Martin

Wakely, Richard

Warren, Fergal

Whelan, Martin

Woodworth, Anne

Arts Officer, Cavan County Council St. Mary's Brass and Reed Band, Kingscourt Arts Officer, Waterford County Council Artane School of Music Waterford Music Club Cork Youth Orchestra Scoil Samhraidh Willie Clancy O'Shea-Farren, Linda Music Education Action Group Ó Suilleabháin, Mícheál Irish World Music Centre, University of Limerick Dublin Institute of Technology

Cork School of Music

Irish World Music Centre, University of Limerick Poudevigne-Biondi, Marie-Hélene

Quinn, Martin National Youth Federation County Laois VEC Russell, Lucina Arts Officer, Kildare County Council

Galway City VEC Dublin Institute of Technology Arts Council of Northern Ireland Cork School of Music Dublin Institute of Technology Irish World Music Centre, University of Limerick South Tipperary Arts Centre Leeson Park School of Music

County Kerry VEC County Donegal VEC Interim Governing Body, IAPA Dublin Institute of Technology

Whitehead, Candace Cork School of Music Waterford Institute of Technology School of Music

International Contributors

Bollard, Mary	Formerly of West Berkshire Young		
	Musicians' Trust, England		
Crighton, Diane	Music Service, South Eastern Education		
	and Library Board, Northern Ireland		
Doherty, Donal	Music Service, Western Education and		
	Library Board, Northern Ireland		
Fegran, Tone	Trondheim Kommunale Kulturskole,		
	Norway		
Laakso, Ilari	PIRAMK/School of Music, Tampere,		
	Finland		
Hewitt, Robin	Formerly of City of Belfast School of		
	Music		
Helgesen, Katrine	Norsk Kulturskolerad		
Hickman, Richard	Federation of Music Services, Britain		
Hicks, Colin	Cultural Attaché, Québec, Canada		
Hjemas, Vidal	Trondheim Kommunale Kulturskole		
	(TKK) and Norsk Kurlturskolerad, Norway		
Klemmitainen, Timo	Finnish Music Schools Association		
Nordman, Rolf	Kuula – Institutet, Finland		
Renshaw, Peter	Formerly of Guildhall School of Music		
	and Drama, London		
Sonstad, Brnjar	Trondheim Kommunale Kulturskole,		
	Norway		
Svendsen, Even Fossum Norsk Kulturskolerad, Trondheim,			
	Norway		
Vatlestad, Oddvin	Norsk Kulturskolerad, Norway		
Veijola, Timo	Espoo Music Institute, Finland		
Width, Arve	Norsk Kulturskolerad, Norway		

Summary of a survey of VECs to ascertain the degree of VEC involvement (if any) in instrumental tuition programmes, October 2002

Survey conducted by Irish Vocational Education Association

The responses to the survey were quite varied. A small number of VECs are involved quite extensively in instrumental tuition programmes, a small number have limited involvement, while the majority has no involvement (primarily due to a lack of resources/funding). However, all respondents are enthusiastic about possible co-ordination with Music Network and have indicated that they view the provision of instrumental tuition as an important component of a complete education programme.

The information presented below refers to VECs which responded to the survey:

- County Carlow VEC offers instrumental music tuition in three of its schools.
- County Clare VEC does not have a tuition programme at this time.

County Cork VEC

runs the County Cork School of Music, offering tuition in classical and traditional music to around 1,820 students at 27 centres around County Cork.

County Donegal VEC

through its self-financing adult education programme has administered instrumental tuition through the Donegal School of Music.

The project involves the following steps:

- students pay fees to Donegal VEC
- Donegal School of Music provides musical tuition to small groups of students, mainly in VEC premises
- Donegal School of Music submits claim forms to Donegal VEC for payment
- Donegal VEC certifies payment to tutors.
- The programme is self-financing and is organised from September to May each year, with approximately 221 students availing of the service.

City of Dublin VEC

offers instrumental tuition at Kylemore College, and is exploring the possibility of expanding this service to other vocational schools.

County Galway VEC

currently administers 12 Vocational Schools, and of these, 2 schools (New Inn and Ballinasloe Vocational Schools) offer tuition in instrumental music as part of the curriculum. The Committee, in co-operation with the City of Galway VEC, has made a formal application to the Minister for Education and Science for permission to appoint an Arts/Music Organiser to co-ordinate and promote the provision of music education in Galway City and County.

Kerry Education Service

has, for many years, provided instrumental tuition throughout the county to around 600 students in Kerry primary schools, after school hours, through a special "Music Programme". The programme is conducted by the part-time employment of traditional musicians throughout the county, and is managed under the "self-financing" rubric. In the recent past, Kerry Education Service has managed a special CE scheme aimed at instrumental tuition in modern music. Participants developed an ensemble for performance (thereby developing their own skills) and provided introductory performances and tuition to students in VEC schools and centres. This programme was discontinued due to changes in the general CE framework.

County Kildare VEC

4 of its schools offer music as a second-level subject (of these, 2 offer music as an examination subject).

County Laois VEC

has funded Laois School of Music (established in September 2001), which has an enrolment of over 330 students studying piano, strings, woodwind, voice, percussion, kindermusic (for children aged 4-6 years), and those involved in foundation courses and orchestra. The VEC is currently exploring with Laois School of Music the possibility of bringing the School of Music under the auspices of the VEC.

County Leitrim VEC

since 1979, the VEC has operated an Arts Education Programme in collaboration with County Sligo VEC. Under the scheme, teachers of art and music are made available to each of the Committee's schools. In total, approximately 2.5 wholetime teacher equivalents are employed in the Leitrim VEC schools. Tuition is mainly provided to class groups who take Junior Certificate art and music, but in a very limited number of cases, individual instrumental tuition has been provided. However, on a self-financing basis, individual instrumental tuition is regarded as prohibitively expensive, especially for younger students.

City of Limerick VEC

Limerick Municipal School of Music operates under the auspices of City of Limerick VEC. It provides tuition in strings, piano, organ, recorder, woodwind, brass, voice, speech, music theory (including an adult class), Junior Certificate music and Leaving Certificate music. Current student numbers are approximately 1,100. This school caters mainly for students from 6 years to Leaving Certificate level, and some adults.

County Louth VEC

currently has no involvement in instrumental programmes.

County Mayo VEC

currently has no involvement in instrumental music tuition.

County Meath VEC

2 of the committee's 8 schools provide music as an examination subject. 1 of these provides tuition in piano for grade exams. Another school provides extra-curricular, free tuition in guitar and drums.

County Monaghan VEC

has provided instrumental tuition for many years in instruments including piano, guitar, keyboard, violin and wind, as well as traditional accordion, tin whistle and flute. Classes have occurred in the early evening for young people in both Monaghan and Castleblayney, with an average of 75 participants per term. Guitar has also been popular as an adult education class in Monaghan, Castleblayney and Carrickmacross, with an average of 15-20 adults involved per session. The VEC has also part-funded a summer school training programme for Monaghan Community Brass Band on a number of occasions.

County Westmeath VEC

instrumental tuition programmes under the auspices of County Westmeath VEC and administered by Midland Arts, Kinnegad, have been available for almost 20 years to both children and adults in centres in Mullingar, Castlepollard, Killucan and Kinnegad. The centres are all community colleges, and students of the colleges are actively encouraged to participate. A major expansion of this County Music Scheme took place in 2002 when Athlone was added to the list of centres and the teaching of popular instruments such as acoustic and electric guitar, keyboard and drums was added to the scheme's music syllabus. The scheme employs 12 part-time tutors. Instruments currently available include piano, keyboard, saxophone, pipe organ, classical guitar, acoustic guitar, electric guitar, harp and percussion. 65 students were enrolled for the first 2 terms of 2001/2002 and, following the extension of the scheme, another 65 enrolled, bringing the total number of students to 130.

County Wicklow VEC

Bray Music Centre was established under Bray VEC and now operates under the auspices of County Wicklow VEC. It is attached to Bray Institute of Further Education and runs mainly as a self-financing venture with some financial support from BIFE. The Music Centre has 19 teachers and caters for over 330 students, including adults and children. Students attend individual and group classes in piano, violin, viola, cello, double bass, flute, clarinet, saxophone, recorder, guitar, Music Initiation (a pre-instrumental class), singing and music theory. The centre also offers group classes in Musicianship for Junior and Leaving Certificate.

Irish Sports Council's Local Sports Partnerships

Local Sports Partnerships

In A New Era for Sport, The Irish Sports Council Strategy 2000-2002, the Council prioritises the 'fostering and supporting of innovative Local Sports Partnership at County or City level, designed to co-ordinate and promote the development of sport'. It is in this context that the ISC has established a delivery mechanism through which the work currently ongoing at local level can be enhanced, and the work that needs to be done can be effectively tackled.

The Council is generating sports programmes for adoption and adaptation by Local Sports Partnerships to suit local needs, with an emphasis on the provision of quality training and support materials for sports leaders, coaches, parents and volunteers. The new policy has involved a radical overhaul of the functions of the Local Sports Unit (a unit within the ISC). The Local Sports Unit is charged with developing strategies for increasing participation in recreational sport and co-ordinating their implementation by all bodies involved in promoting recreational sport. The implementation of the Local Sports Partnerships is the responsibility of the Local Sports Unit. The Partnerships are being introduced on a phased basis over a three-year period, which started in 2001.

Local Sports Partnerships, through their programmes, will encourage participation across all age groups in their local areas, working closely with local communities, agencies on the ground and national bodies. The Irish Sports Council sees these partnerships as the best mechanism for delivering recreational sport to the greatest number of people.

Key tasks of the partnerships will be:

- to build on work already being carried out to date;
- to establish a sustainable structure to assist all those involved to meet the challenges facing local sports development (e.g. recruiting/managing volunteers, quality training, etc.);
- to increase usage of facilities and
- to create and implement plans for long-term local sports development.

Membership of the LSP

All those statutory bodies, organisations and groups operating in local areas with a responsibility for/interest in sports development should be invited to participate in the Local Sports Partnership. The involvement of the VECs, Local Authorities, Health Boards, FÁS, third-level sector, commercial interests, sports clubs/organisations, schools and voluntary/community groups in the partnership will be important.

Role of the Local Sports Partnership

The key aims of the LSPs will be to increase participation in sport and to ensure that local resources are used to best effect. The outcomes sought from the Local Sports Partnerships are

- enhanced planning of sport at local level
- increased levels of local participation, especially amongst specific target groups such as older people, girls and women, people with disabilities, unemployed people and those who live in identified disadvantaged communities
- enhanced local coach deployment
- club development
- volunteer training
- local directories of sports bodies and facilities
- better use of existing facilities
- clear priorities for local facility provision and improvement, with related quality management initiatives
- school/club/community and possibly school-NGB links
- local sports events.

Local Structure

The LSP will lead a consultative forum, which will represent the views of all local interest groups. The LSP will be established as an independent body with its priorities decided in consultation with its constituent members. It is proposed that the LSP should be incorporated as a company limited by guarantee. This will ensure that all funding made available to the LSP can be dedicated solely to work in the sports sector. The Board of Directors of the LSP should be made up of representatives of those agencies regarded as key influencers in local sports development. The LSP will employ the Local Sports Co-ordinator and will set the priorities for the work of this officer. The main strength of this process lies in the emphasis on decision-making at local level so that the strategy developed is supported by the local agencies/organisations/people concerned. The ISC will provide support and advice to the partnerships and work to create productive relations with the Local Sports Co-ordinator.

Assistance to Local Sports Partnerships

The Irish Sports Council Local Sports Unit will provide a full support service to the Local Sports Partnerships. Staff from this Unit will facilitate the initial establishment of Local Sports Partnerships and local sports fora. The ISC will provide sample job descriptions for Local Sports Co-ordinator posts and will assist in the recruitment of these officers. The Unit will also provide advice and guidance on the strategic planning process, which each LSP will undertake.

The Local Sports Unit aims to establish good working relationships with Local Sports Co-ordinators and provide them with training and information updates. A co-ordinators' network will also be put in place so that they can exchange information on best practice directly with one another. The ISC will also be involved in the development and dissemination of specific programmes, courses and resource materials to the LSPs.

Two types of grant aid will be offered:

- Local Sports Partnership Core Funding towards the costs of employing local Sports Officers, based in the local authority or VEC and working to develop the local sports partnerships and innovative local initiatives.
- Local Sports Partnership Challenge Funding for specific, high priority targeted initiatives identified and promoted by Local Sports Partnerships. As funding of local Sports Officers reduces, the amount available in the Challenge Fund will rise.

Local Sports Partnerships Guidelines and Eligibility Criteria

Applicants are asked to make submissions for consideration as pilot sites for the Local Sports Partnerships initiative. Eight sites were chosen for 2001, with further sites coming on-stream in 2002 and 2003. Short-listed groups are asked to make presentations to a Review Panel.

Submissions

Submissions should be drawn up on behalf of the proposed partnership to include the following:

- Designation of area of operation: it is recommended that partnerships should operate on a city/county level.
- Local agencies/groups involved in the partnership: a comprehensive list of all organisations that have expressed an interest in participating in the partnership should be included in submissions. Examples of these organisations are VECs, Local Authorities, Health Boards, FÁS, private facility providers, commercial interests, sports clubs and voluntary/community groups, particularly those capable of promoting sport in disadvantaged areas.
- Experience of local agencies/groups in sports development work
- Resources available to the partnership: resources such as facilities, staff, additional funding sources and other support, which would be available to the partnership following its establishment should be detailed in the submission. This information will be used to gauge the long-term sustainability of a partnership in an area.
- Method by which the partnership will be established: detailing the commitment received or undertaking given by the local agencies listed in the submission. Any initial work which may have been done to bring a partnership together, i.e. sports forum, public meeting should be referred to. Details of how the partnership will operate in tandem and maintain close links with state agencies, local bodies and other groups in the area should also be included. Areas should estimate the length of time it will take them to establish their Local Sports Partnership. Work already completed on this timeline such as convening a sports forum should be included. Groups are also asked to describe the way in which they will establish their forum and partnership.

Assessment

Only those groups that have the support and involvement of the local agencies detailed in these guidelines are considered eligible for selection as a Local Sports Partnership. Applications from groups of individuals solely will not be accepted but these groups will be encouraged to make contact with their local agencies.

Applications will be assessed on the basis of the submissions made to the ISC. Therefore, it is the responsibility of the applicant group to ensure they include sufficient information to support their case for selection.

The submission must show evidence of sustainability for the partnership by demonstrating the level of commitment by local agencies. Additionally, there should be willingness in the partnership to pool and invest resources to develop sport at local level.

Attention will also be given to the experience within the partnership in relation to sports development work at a local level.

In the selection of the initial tranche, consideration was given to the capacity of the group to respond to the requirements of creating a partnership within the timeframe proposed. Important in this regard was any groundwork that the group had already undertaken.

Consideration is also given to the bidder's understanding of the ISC's strategic approach to the development of Irish sport. In selecting pilot sites the ISC takes account of the representative spread of LSPs throughout the country, the urban/rural sector and areas of disadvantage.

This appendix is based on information obtained from the Irish Sports Council's website, at www.sportscouncil.ie

Third-Level and Postgraduate Music and Music Education Courses in Ireland

The information contained in this appendix is taken from Music Network's "Irish Music Handbook Online" publication (see www.musicnetwork.ie/imhonline.html).

Ballyfermot College of Further Education Ceoltóir (http://www.daycourses.com/profiles/bcfe) Set up by Ballyfermot College of Further Education (BCFE) to provide structured training for traditional musicians at undergraduate level. Began in September 1994 with a Certificate in Progressive Traditional and Folk Music Performance. In 1996 ran a Certificate in Professional Traditional Music Performance and now runs a Higher National Diploma in same (two-year course). Diploma caters for people who have previous experience in the performance of traditional music and song. Key areas of the courses include: source material, arrangement and performance, music technology, music business and traditional music from other countries. Showcase performances are held frequently in well-known venues.

Ballyfermot College of Further Education

(http://www.daycourses.com/profiles/bcfe) Offers a Higher National Diploma in Music Management and Production (two years), BA (Hons) in Media Management and Production (top-up vocational degree for successful graduates of other media courses), Higher National Diploma in Music Technology and Multi-Media Applications (two years), National Diploma in Popular Music Performance (two years), and a Higher National Diploma in Traditional Music Performance (two years).

Comhaltas Ceoltóirí Éireann

(http://www.comhaltas.com)

Founded in 1951 to promote Irish traditional music, song, dance and the Irish language, Comhaltas Ceoltóirí Éireann offers a diploma course for Irish traditional music teachers.

Cork School of Music – A Constituent School of Cork Institute of Technology (http://www.cit.ie) BMus (four years) – The first and second years are best described respectively as 'foundation' and 'transition' years. After acquiring a secure foundation in the elements of Performance Studies which are: principal and second instrument or voice, ensemble musicmaking (band, choir, opera workshop, orchestral), Applied Musicianship Studies (aural skills, keyboard skills, analysis, and compositional techniques), Historical Studies including Irish traditional music and historical performance practice, Music and Technology (music origination, midi fundamentals, recording studio theory and practice and music industry studies), community music, conducting, music education, music therapy and orchestration, students choose to specialise in either Applied Musicianship Studies, Community Music, Music History, Music and Technology, Music Therapy, Pedagogic Studies (music education) or Performance in their third and fourth year. Cork School of Music also offers an MA course for performers and composers, which is validated by HETAC.

Dublin Institute of Technology – Conservatory of Music and Drama

(http://www.dit.ie/aa/cmd/index.html) Music courses include:

- BMus (four years) with major options in performance/composition/music teaching/Irish traditional music;

- BMusEd (four years) conjoint course with TCD and RIAM;
- Music Foundation Course (one year);
- external diplomas;

 postgraduate courses (research/composition/music technology): Postgraduate Diploma (PGDip), MPhil, PhD; MA (Music Technology).

Froebel College of Education

(http://www.froebel.ie)

Preparatory and basic music programmes which are designed to prepare primary school students/teachers for class use. The Degrees and Diplomas awarded are BEd, Higher Diploma in Primary Education, and postgraduate Diploma in Froebel Education.

Irish World Music Centre – University of Limerick (http://www.ul.ie/~iwmc)

Courses include: BA Degree in Irish Music and Dance, MAs in Community Music, Irish Traditional Music Performance, Classical String Performance, Chant and Ritual Song, Dance Performance (traditional and contemporary), Ethnomusicology, Ethnochoreology, Music Therapy, Graduate Diploma in Music Education, and research degrees at Masters and Doctorate levels in all related areas. Mary Immaculate College – University of Limerick (http://www.mic.ul.ie/music/music.htm) Music courses offered include: BMus degree, BEd in Primary Teaching with music, BA in Liberal Arts with music, Diploma in Music & Music Education (part time) and an MA and PhD in Musicology & Music Education by research.

Mater Dei Institute of Education

(http://www.materdei.ie)

Courses offered include music to primary degree level (i.e. arts elective subject in Bachelor of Religious Science) with Education and Religious Studies (Theology). Liturgical music module is offered in final year. Degrees and Diplomas awarded are BA in Religious Studies, MA in Religious Science, Chaplaincy Studies and a Graduate Diploma in Religious Studies (GDRS). The music courses cover compositional skills (harmony/counter-point), historical and analytical studies, performance and keyboard studies for classroom practitioners. Traditional musicians may present one traditional piece of music in part fulfilment of the practical examination requirements at the end of each academic year.

National University of Ireland Maynooth (http://may.ie/academic)

Music courses offered include: three year BMus, BA (two subjects, one of which is music for three years), MA for one year full-time or two years part-time taught courses in Performance and Musicology or Historical Studies or Composition, MA and PhD also awarded on pure research, HDip in Music Technology, Diploma in Arts in Church Music (one year full-time or two years part-time).

Newpark Music Centre

(http://www.newparkmusic.com/general_school.html) Offers a full-time professional music training course and Diploma in Jazz Studies.

Royal Irish Academy of Music (http://www.riam.ie) Courses offered include: a BA in Music Performance for four years (validated by Dublin City University), BA in Music Education for four years (validated by Trinity College Dublin), Master of Music in Performance for two years (validated by Dublin City University), Access Course of one year duration, Diploma in Music (Performance and Teaching) for one year and a Certificate in Conducting for one year.

St Patrick's College Drumcondra

(http://www.spd.dcu.ie) Music courses offered include BEd degree with music as an academic subject for three years, BA with music as a two-subject arts degree, MEd with music as a specialist area and an MA is offered in research. Performance is 20% of each year of the BEd and BA, this includes solo, chamber music, ensemble and conducting.

Tralee Institute of Technology

(http://www.ittralee.ie) Offers a National Diploma in Humanities (Irish Folk Theatre Studies). This course is designed and implemented in co-operation with Siamsa Tíre – The National Folk Theatre.

Trinity College Dublin

(http://www.tcd.ie/Music/Index.html) Music courses offered include: a BA Moderatorship in Music for four years, Two Subject Moderatorship including music as one subject for four years, BMusEd for four years, in conjunction with the Royal Irish Academy of Music and the Dublin Institute of Technology College of Music.

University College Cork

(http://www.ucc.ie/acad/music) Courses offered include: degree programmes relating to the study of western music, Irish traditional music and world music. Selected repertories are studied both academically and through performance. Degrees and Diplomas awarded include: a BMus for four years, BA Music Single Honours for three years, BA Music Joint Honours for three years, MA taught postgraduate programmes for two years, MPhil research degree for two years, MMus in performance/ research for two years, PhD research or original composition for three years.

University College Dublin

(http://www.ucd.ie/~music)

The music courses offered include: a BA in Music for three years, BMus for four years, MA in Musicology (taught course for one year), MLit by research for two years and a PhD in Musicology for three to five years.

Waterford Institute of Technology

(http://www.wit.ie/soh)

Music courses offered include: a BA Music, MA in Performance, MA and PhD in Music Editing, Music Composition, Contemporary Music History and Analysis. Each student has the option of either studying two instruments to a high level of performance or one instrument and a subsidiary subject in either English, French, Arts Administration, Dance or Music Therapy.